CLIMATEGATE: 30 YEARS IN THE MAKING

(CRU) CLIMATIC RESEARCH UNIT, UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA -- ENG

ΓΗ BRIFFA: deputy director; lead author of the millennial paleoclimate section

HRIS FOLLAND: research fellow; former head Met Office Hadley Centre Climate

(TCCCR) TYNDALL CENTRE FOR CLIMATE CHANGE RESEARCH -- ENG

TIM MITCHELL: present 1997-2004: PhD: 2001: UEA (supervised by Mike Hulme)

(NASA GISS) NATIONAL AERONAUTICS AND SPACE ADMINISTRATION:

GAVIN SCHMIDT: climatologist; modeler; co-founder of realclimate.org.

(NCAR) NATIONAL CENTER FOR ATMOSPHERIC RESEARCH -- USA

GODDARD INSTITUTE FOR SPACE STUDIES, COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY -- USA

(NOAA NCDC) NATIONAL OCEANIC AND ATMOSPHERIC ADMINISTRATION:

KEVIN TRENBERTH: head of climate analysis section; lead author of the 1995, 2001,

CASPAR AMMANN: scientist: climate and global dynamics; co-founder realclimate.org.

MICHAEL E. MANN: director Earth System Science Center; lead author of the hockey

(UCAR) UNIVERSITY CORPORATION FOR ATMOSPHERIC RESEARCH - USA

TOM WIGLEY: senior scientist; former director and current visiting fellow: CRU.

Observed temperature (5-year running mear

Aug, 1981 (trend lines added)

NEW YORK TIMES: COOLING

March 9. 1980: "Scientists are reviving the

hilling of the world's climate." [2]

ntroversial notion that millions of cubic miles of

tarctic ice can sometimes abruptly slip off the

ntinent into the sea, resulting in extreme increases

115]; possibly software author "Harry" (of HARRY_READ_ME.TXT) was analyzing.

PHIL JONES: director; custodian of CRU temperature set; contributor to IPCC.

TREVOR DAVIES: former director; current pro-vice chancellor UEA;

MET OFFICE HADLEY CENTRE FOR CLIMATE CHANGE -- ENG

MIKE HULME: director; fellow, professor of climate science: UEA.

TIM OSBORN: academic fellow; specialist in climate modeling.

IAN "HARRY" HARRIS: researcher, programmer.

MICK KELLY: fellow; leading climate scientist.

JAMES HANSEN: director.

THOMAS KARL: director.

and 2007 IPCC reports. [102]

NATIONAL CLIMATIC DATA CENTER -- USA

(PSU) PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY -- USA

stick graph; co-founder of realclimate.org.

EUGENE WAHL: physical scientist: paleoclimatology. [104]

"A LITTLE TRUTH REPELS MUCH FALSEHOOD, JUST AS A LITTLE FIRE BURNS A LOT OF WOOD."

A STORY OF INTRIGUE, DECEPTION AND SECRECY

the Worst Scientific Scandal of Our Generation," Christopher Booker summarized the far-reaching ramifications of what was The reason why even the Guardian's George Monbiot has expressed total shock and dismay at the picture revealed by ments is that their authors are not just any old bunch of academics. Their importance cannot be overestimated, ming than any others, not least through the role they play at the heart of the UN's Intergovernmental Panel on Climate ofessor Philip Jones, the CRU's director, is in charge of the two key sets of data used by the IPCC to draw up its reports. Throu link to the Hadley Centre, part of the UK Met Office, which selects most of the IPCC's key scientific contributors, his glob temperature record is the most important of the four sets of temperature data on which the IPCC and governments rely - not least for their predictions that the world will warm to catastrophic levels unless trillions of dollars are spent to avert it. Dr Jones is also a key part of the closely knit group of American and British scientists responsible for promoting that picture of world temperatures conveyed by Michael Mann's "hockey stick" graph which 10 years ago turned climate history on its head by showing that, after 1,000 years of decline, global temperatures have recently shot up to their highest level in recorded history.

On November 17, 2009 some 3,000 e-mails, software files, and other documents from the University of East Anglia's Clima

Research Unit were covertly released onto the Internet. In his November 28, 2009 telegraph.co.uk article "Climate Change: This i

Given star billing by the IPCC, not least for the way it appeared to eliminate the long-accepted Mediaeval Warm Period wh temperatures were higher they are today, the graph became the central icon of the entire man-made global warming movement Since 2003, however, when the statistical methods used to create the "hockey stick" were first exposed as fundamentally flawed an expert Canadian statistician Steve McIntyre, an increasingly heated battle has been raging between Mann's supporters, calling themselves "the Hockey Team", and McIntyre and his own allies, as they have ever more devastatingly called into question the entire statistical basis on which the IPCC and CRU construct their case. ich as Dr Mann himself, Dr Iones and his CRU colleague Keith Briffa, but Ben Santer, responsible for a highly c rewriting of key passages in the IPCC's 1995 report; Kevin Trenberth, who similarly controversially pushed the IPCC ir scaremongering over hurricane activity; and Gavin Schmidt, right-hand man to Al Gore's ally Dr James Hansen, whose own GISS record of surface temperature data is second in importance only to that of the CRU itself. [16]

Writing in The Atlantic, Clive Crook is more candid: "In my previous post on Climategate I blithely said that nothing in the climate science email dump surprised me much. Having waded more deeply over the weekend I take that back. The closed-mindedness of these suppose men of science, their willingness to go to any lengths to defend a preconceived message, is surprising even to me. The stink of intellectua As Charlie Martin explained in "Global WarmingGate: What Does It Mean," the e-mails suggested: 1) [T]he authors co-operated covertly to ensure that only papers favorable to CO2-forced AGW [Anthropogenic Glob

Warming or man-made global warming] were published, and that editors and journals publishing contrary papers were punished. They also attempted to 'discipline' scientists and journalists who published skeptical information.) [T]he authors manipulated and 'massaged' the data to strengthen the case in favor of unprecedented CO2-forced AGW, and to suppress their own data if it called AGW into question. 3) [T]he authors co-operated (perhaps the word is 'conspired') to prevent data from being made available to other researcher through either data archiving requests or through the Freedom of Information Acts of both the U.S. and the UK. [17]

THE CLIMATEGATE TIMELINE AND THE TICKING TIME BOMB

To better appreciate these themes, this Timeline chart consolidates and chronologically organizes information uncovered a published about the CRU e-mails by many researchers (see references) to visually show who said or did what and when from simultaneous events, to understand the context in which events occurred. There is far more information than can assembled in one place, and more continues to be uncovered, but some of the key material found to-date has been included. poth with bomb icons). The first sets out the shaky foundation underpinning the AGW (Anthropogenic Global Warming man-made global warming) enterprise, and the second an admission of its failure. I ogether, they help explain why everything the ccurred in between (as revealed by the CRU documents and independent researchers like Steven McIntyre) was inevitable The story that emerges is not of a smoking gun, but of a 30-year time bomb whose fuse was lit in 1981, when -- despite only a andful of scientists supporting it -- the AGW theory was championed, without question, by the Popular Press. the models to stave off questions and the losses that would ensue to the billion dollar climate industry: "\$32 billion for clim research, and another \$36 billion for development of climate-related technologies" by the US government alone. [131] results using its own models and data was unable to do so after three years. Releasing the data and computer codes behind the nodels for others to review and verify was out of the question. Though FOI requests are redundant for peer-reviewed researc he CRU's refusal to release data and methods used for papers published in respected peer-reviewed journals, despite jour les prohibiting such refusals, inevitably led to legal FOI requests, if for no other reason than that some scientists were insisting the world commit trillions of dollars to economic policies based on what they claimed their research showed. elease it. The avoidance of Freedom of Information requests...." [66] Thus, while UEA and Pennsylvania State University said they investigating the matter [69], the UK Met Office (which works closely with the CRU and relies heavily on its product) announce a 3-year project to re-examine 160 years of temperature data, signalling its own lack of confidence in its CRU-based record. What about the supposedly independent temperature records of NASA's GISS and NOAA's NCDC? CRU, GISS and NCDC get most of their raw data from NOAA's GHCN. [50] [1255298593.txt] Serious irregularities and questionable adjustments a tarting to surface with the source GHCN data itself. [50] [60] [62] [67] [72] [77] [114] [132] [168] [171] "The number of actu

grees latitude, where temperatures are naturally warmer. [168:1] And so, like the Three Musketeers, the CRU, GISS Data fudging and secrecy aside, by 1998, Earth had stopped warming and begun cooling, despite record levels of CO2 (large blue) event box with a bomb icon). This divergence between AGW theory and reality grew so enormous that by October 12, 2 Kevin Trenberth, in a fit of frustration, e-mailed his colleagues: "Where the heck is global warming?" "The fact is that we can't account for the lack of warming at the moment and it is a travesty that we can't." The reason he gave for their inability to account for cooling vas that "[T]he data are surely wrong. Our observing system is inadequate." In other words, the findings indicating cooling we evident that blind faith and bankrupt logic are now masquerading as rational science. The matter now much technic-babble is d to make today's climate models sound impressive, they have all proved wrong. The hockey team scientists admit they hav These problems would have been publicized years ago if the AGW theorists didn't have powerful allies: policy makers in virtua every professional scientific body, editors of virtually every major scientific journal, and reporters and editors at virtually nainstream media outlets. Few provided unbiased, impartial forums where alternate views and evidence were aired and debate nstead, most took official positions, invariably with an air of authority, and spared no effort to ensure that voices against tl artificial consensus were quashed by editorial fiat and a persistent campaign of vilification, intimidation, and ridicule. 「wenty-first Century science has borrowed a page from the medieval Church in using fear and persecution to silence skeptic

Fhe oppressed have become the oppressors. Given that most professional scientific bodies and peer-reviewed journals ha

been active accomplices in this scandal, one wonders how many other "scientific consensuses" have been similarly engineered.

TIME MAGAZINE (June 24, 1974): "Climatological Cassandras are becoming increasingly apprehensive for the weather aberrations they are studying may be the harbinger of another ice age." [1] cooling widely considered to be inevitable." [2] EWSWEEK (April 28, 1975): The Cooling W threat of a new ice age must now stand alongsion iclear war as a likely source of wholesale de and misery for mankind." -- Nigel Calder [150] See [135] for media coverage of warming and

BOLIN (LATER THE 1ST IPCC CHAIRMAN) SUGGESTS ON BBC'S "TH WEATHER MACHINE" THAT CO2 MIGHT CAUSE GLOBAL WARMING en on international television talking about the dangers of carbon dioxide, and I nember being bitterly criticized by top experts for indulging him in his ne Royal Society, and she said: 'There's money on the table for you to prove r [i.e. CO2 induced warming], because she was in favor of nuclear power for many LIN ON THE BBC: "And there is a lot of oil, and there are vo

ATE ARE HELD BETWEEN 1978 AND 1980 REVEALS NO CLEAR OUTLOOK Gases" in the journal Science, and state: "Anthropogenic gases may alter our climate by þlugging an atmosþheri window for escaping radiation." [11] In 1976, the National Defense NOAA, surveying 24 climatologists from 7 countries on their estimates Department of Energy. [10:1] 0.2 1860 1880 1900 1920 1940 1960 1980 2000 The period 1890-1894 is the zero reference base.

OBAL COOLING DESPITE THE

S IT APPEARED IN 1980 DATA)

DURING THE POST WAR ECONOMIC BOO

COOLING SINCE 1940, AND NO CONSENSUS ON IE IPCC IS CONCEIVED

nperature could occur which is greater than any in man's history." nd by international agencies, based on this scientific consensus." [130] Authors of CRU e-mails, including JONES and WIGLEY, attended this conference. [13]

th he makes dramatic predictions about C entists publicly rebuked Hansen, saving he had

d for government action is more urgent than previously thought. According to a joint Goddard Institute for Space Studies, in testimony before Sen. Al Gore's Committee on cated "caution not panic", and weighed in against the percent of 1988 levels by 2004 had minimal scientific support. scientists were critical of the approach taken by Hansen a historian Spencer Weart, 'respected scientists publicly rebuked

LIMATE CHANGE (IPCC)

FIRST IPCC ASSESSMENT REPORT {MEDIEVAL WARM PERIOD 1995}. CINTYRE AND MCKITRICK Nov. 2003}) that flatter MWP and LIA, and turned dramatically upward in the mic twentieth century, creating an impression that global temperatures had previously been stable.

Little Ice Age Warm Period 1500 AD 1900 AD

climate." -- IPCC 1995 (rewrite) [126]

lar 7, 1996 - Nov 12, 2009 IOD COVERED BY CRU E-MAILS AY 31, 1991 (AS PER THE FILES' LAST EDIT DAT STREET JOURNAL, "A MAJOR DECEPTION OF GLOBAL WARMING," MANN COMES ON BOARD: "I LIKE THE IDEA. INCLUDE ME IN" BRADLEY: NO CONSENSUS EVEN AT CRU AND WE ARE NOT GATEKEEPERS From "Climategate Part I - A 2,000-page epic of science and skepticism" "This IPCC report, like all others, is held in such high regard largely because it has been pee RADLEY is so offended by some comment reviewed. That is, it has been read, discussed, modified, and approved by an international b NN that he titles this e-mail "CENSORED!!.

as a seemingly out-of-the-blue email [0898099393.txt] on June of experts. These scientists have laid their reputations on the line. But, this report is not wl 98, from Michael Mann to Phil Jones, then head of East Anglia's CRU cen ppears to be — it is not the version that was approved by the contributing scientists l Before then, no mention had been made in the email cache of Michael Mann... Physical Society, I have never witnessed a more disturbing corruption of the peer-review process course I'll be happy to be on board. I think the opportunity for some direct than the events that led to this IPCC report.... n between us (me, and you/tim/keith) is ripe, and the plan "The following passages are examples of those included in the report as approved by the scientists but deleted from the supposedly peer-reviewed published version: - 'None of the studies cited above has shown clear evidence that we can attribute the observed c datasets with manufactured biases/etc remains high priority [climate] changes to the specific cause of increases in greenhouse gases.' d all fit into the proposal you mention. There may be some overl als we will eventually submit to NSF (renewal of our present fund - 'No study to date has positively attributed all or part [of the climate change observed to d tc. by I don't see a problem with that in the least. to anthropogenic [man-made] causes.'" [15] ce the collaboration is officially in place, I think that sharing of codes, dat "A leading article in Nature (June 13 [1996]), while dismissive of IPCC critics, had to admit tha 'phrases that might have been (mis)interpreted as undermining ... [IPCC] conclusions ... "disappeared" in the revision process." [14] r. Benjamin] Santer was lead author of Chapter 8 for the 1995 IPCC Report and involve this] major controversy. He altered contents of the Chapter so it agreed vummary for Policymakers (SPM) without consent of other authors." has always taken full responsibility for making the actual changes, although he has not been forthcoming in revealing who instructed him to make such revisions and who approved them

d not be a problem. I would be happy to make mine available, though an't promise its the most user friendly thing in the world. ort, I like the idea. Include me in, and let me know what you [n]eed from after they were made. He has, however, told others privately that he was asked [prevailed upon so by IPCC co-chairman John Houghton. ... [A] November 15 letter from the State artment ... [instructed] Dr. Houghton to 'prevail upon' chapter authors 'to modify their text. t hublished his infamous haber [see {MANN 1998}] quickly ros dominant figure in the paleoclimate effort.... The core of that paper was a raphic that would come to be known as the graphic "hockey stick" DECEMBER 12, 2009: UPDATE ON THE IPCC'S "PEER REVIEW" PROCESS entation of the temperature over the past centuries. D CHRISTOPHER MONCKTON, REPORTING FROM THE COPENHAG "With Mr. Mann on board, everybody else seemed to go overboard. In the emails, he soon elbowed out Keith Briffa as the prime tree-ring guru. The M authors of the IPCC's climate assessments who decided whether the reviewers ick, and the science work behind it, would end up consuming ds of email hours over the next decade." [124:1] comments were acceptable. That -- whatever else it is -- is not peer review." [76]

O HIDE COOLING: BURY IT IN SOFTWARE "FUDGE FACTORS"

**** APPLIES A VERY ARTIFICIAL CORRECTION FOR DECLINE*******

warm peak [{GRAPH 1981}]. (See [34] [35] [22] [153] for more information.)

After 1940, Earth cooled, while atmospheric CO2 increased: the opposite of what should ha

/aladj=[0.,0.,0.,0.,0.,-0.1,-0.25,-0.3,0.,-0.1,0.3,0.8,1.2,1.7,2.5,2.6,2.6,2.6,2.6,2.6]*0.75 ;fudge factor

ese two lines of code establish a twenty-element array (yrloc) comprising the year 1400 (base year

operatures in the 1930s, and raises the cool temperatures after 1940, softening the 1940

he 1940 "warming blip" has always been a problem. See {WIGLEY 27.Sep.09} where WIGLEY

I JONES discuss how to reduce the 1940 "warming blip." This time the solution is to try to

educe warm temperatures as opposed to the above attempt to increase cool temperatures.

we know the file starts at yr 440, but we want nothing till 1400, so we

nt all lines (10 yr þer line) from 1400 to 1980, which is

1990-1400)/10 + 1 lines (since 1991 is on line beginning 1990)

now the file starts at yr 1070, but we want nothing till 1400, so v

kill lines (1400-440)/10 + 1 header line

ording to AGW theory. Buried in two CRU files of software code was w

ner described as a "fudge factor" and labeled "a VERY ARTIFICIAL correction for

(Date from BRIFFA_SEP98_E.PRO file's last edit.)

decline." This code is shown below.

Corcoran explains that BRIFFA was "struggling with Russian tree-ring results and the orts of Russian scientists on their difficulties. Their findings often contradicted the idea October 1998 [0907975032.txt] - implying mmon in the past and nothing unusual was happening today. ie reference to 750-1450 would appear to support the long-held scientific view on the nce of a Medieval Warm Period that might have been hotter than the 20th century. ouple of weeks later, another Russian, Eugene Vaganov, wrote in a paper saying that makes clear that there is no conse e warming in the middle of the 20th century is not extraordinary. The warming at the e the "gatekeeper" role many have assum of Mr. Briffa's critical paper, he blew up...." ies of heated e-mails ensue and it "appears, moreover, that Mr. Mann had t respect for them and for their work. Of course ed with the peer-review process of Mr. Briffa's article at Science magazine. One o ree with everything they write, and we often r. Mann's associates, Raymond Bradley at the University of Massachusetts, on April Science editor Julia Uppenbrink, saying, 'I would like to disassociate myself fro MANN to JONES, BRIFFA and nn's view' regarding the climate warming article. Mr. Bradley sends a b nail to Mr. Briffa." [See {BRADLEY 19.Apr.1999}] ners: "I trust that history will give ', as though they all march in x-step seems bizarre. r thinking that it is 'Better that nothing abb

mething unnacceptable to us'.....as though

RIFFA: JUST AS WARM 1000 YEARS AGO

"zero-order draft" of TAR (MANN in attendance). [0929985154.

ntemporary information about the meeting." "[The] IPCC was alred

emperature history over the past 1000 years was a 'clear

tructuring the Summary for Policy-makers, and a proxy diagram

[A] version of the proxy diagram was presented at the Tanzania

ther authors to show a 'nice tidy story' of 'unprecedented warming i

nstruction, which may or may not be relevant to the eventual

final IPCC diagram (2.21) is shown ... [{IPCC 2001}] In this

methodology to 'hide the decline'" (used by the IPCC, which is

eeks later in {JONES 16.Nov.1999}, as explained in [54]

nply delete the offending data (see {HOW TO HIDE

W TO HIDE COOLING: BURY IT IN SOFTWARE

; No need to verify the correct and uncorrected versions, since these

should be identical prior to 1920 or 1930 or whenever the decline

(Date from the file's last edit.)

; was corrected onwards from. [23]

RU PROGRAMMING CODE [CALIBRATE_CORRECTMXD.PRO]

SEPTEMBER 22, 1999: MANN, IONES, BRIFFA and

MCINTYRE'S "IPCC AND THE 'TRICK'":

avourite.'" [FOLLAND, 0938018124.txt]

ND (copy to KARL) discuss "IPCC Revisions."

e are the gatekeepers of all that is

seems amazingly arrogant." [0924532891.txt

icceptable in the world of paleoclimatolo

later MANN offers an apology about which Mr. Bradley, Mr. Mann's ate in Massachusetts and co-creator of the hockey stick graph, sends a private sponse to Mr. Briffa: 'Excuse me while I puke ...'" is point in the Climategate emails, the stage has been set for a decade of high Over the next 10 years, the emails become a zone of internal conflict of l battles to suppress criticism, ridicule critics and resist all outside interfe ers, definitely overstates any become a major strategy as all the scientists within the IPCC loop w singular confidence I have in science and papers that contravened or questioned the official view." [124:2] my own [Mann et al] series...."

W TO HIDE COOLING: DON'T USE THE DATA ing with results." [124:1] His data shows cooling after 1960, while the instrument CRU person is on the editorial board, but papers get dealt with by the s warming. (See also [1142108839.txt] in {JONES 12.Aug.1996}). OSBORN BRIFFA: "I believe that the recent warmth was probably matched about 1000 years ago." [0938018124.txt] igh we usually stop the series in 1960 because of the recent non-temperature **signal** that is superimposed on the tree-ring data that we use." [0939154709.txt] em is that "the divergence raises the question that if the tree-ring reconstru MANN: IPCC DOESN'T WANT TO UNDERMINE CONSENSUS ad the higher temperatures of today, **how could the scientists be sure** that ther nd to solve it. OSBORN advises MANN to remove all data after 1960 for the C figure he is preparing, as explained by MCINTYRE (also see [60]): Oct 5, 1999, Osborn (on behalf of Briffa) sent Mann a revised version of the Briffa construction with more 'low-frequency' variability ... a version that is identical up to 1960...." "[T] s version had an even larger late-20th century decline than the version shown at the Tanzania ors' meeting. Nonetheless, the First Order Draft, sent out a few weeks later [see {FIRS¯ [9] contained a new version of the proxy diagram, a version which contains the mo ments of the eventual Third Assessment Report proxy diagram [see {IPCC 2001}]. ous climate scientists, the IPCC Third Assessment Report did not disclose the deletion 1400 1500 1600 1700 1800 1900 2000 t Order and Second Order Drafts, once again without any disclosure." [54] SBORN also advises MANN to try changing the baseline (i.e., to massage the data) if a e prior to 1960 appears. "Indeed, if the non-temperature signal that causes the decline

NG THE STAGE FOR HIGH DRAMA AND INTRIGUE

while pushing the need for more work." [0923937760.txt]

'Climategate Part 2 - A 2,000-page epic of science and skepticism," 7

rcoran explains how BRIFFA and MANN butt heads over BRIFFA'S

orthcoming paper, in which he "decided to mention uncertainties in tree-ring data

FA NOT HAPPY ABOUT CREATING "CONSENSUS" BY EXCLUDING DATA RIFFA: "My concern was motivated by the possibility of expressing an impression of mo ncensus than might actually exist. I suppose the earlier talk implying that we should not uddy the waters' by including contradictory evidence worried me." [0938125/45.txt]

Y TO HIDE COOLING: USE MANN'S "NATURE" TECHNIQUE rote, in the tree-ring records that form the backbone of most of th JONES announces he's successfully used MANN'S "Nature trick" (used to cre ublished estimates, the problem of poor replication near the roversial MBH98 temperature record (see {MCINTYRE Nov.2003} and ginnings of records is particularly acute, and ubiquitous should be treated with considerable caution." [1018647333.tx

MANN 23.Apr.98}) to hide a drop in proxy-based reconstructed temperatures. JONES: Subject: Diagram for WMO Statement

RIFFA publishes BRIFFA2000 [156] which uses the now controversial neasurement temperature data. In 1995 BRIFFA published that 1032 "wo. the millennium nowever new data by schwelligh uper sign al data with the Yamal data without reporting the contradictory results. [157] Yamal data was] used like crack cocaine by paleoclimatologists, and [is critical] in ny spaghetti graph reconstructions ..." [158]

rious about this situation, MCINTYRE requests the data in 2006, but is refused. finally obtains the data by luck in 2009 (see {MCINTYRE 26.Sep.2009}). In fact, he explains, OSBORN even advised the editors of Science in 2006 that he (i. 1400 1450 1500 1550 1600 1650 1700 1750 1800 1850 1900 1950 UN FAO: EARTH WARMS AND COOLS EVERY 30 YEARS The UN Food and Agriculture Organization sought to understand the effect climate change on long-term fluctuations of commercial catches and report t several independent measures showed "a clear 55-65 year periodicit

a approx 30 year warming then cooling) over both short terms (150 $\,$ nd long terms (1500 years). [146:1] The report also highlighted that the urrent "'latitudinal' ... epoch of the 1970-1990s" is in its final stage and a 'meridional' epoch ... is now in its initial stage." [146:2] Latidudinal circulations h corresponded to warm periods and meridional circulations to cool ones.

STABLE, THEN COOLING, GLOBAL TEMPERATURES **DESPITE GREATEST MAN-MADE CO2 EMISSIONS EVER** (5.]ul.2005): "[T]he world had cooled from 1998. OK it has but it is only 7 years of 08): "[T]he [temperature] level has really been quite stable since 200 2.Oct.2009): "The fact is that we can't account for the lack of v

te them. And this is what was done. [36] [127]

relatively stable in earlier centuries.

On March 15, 1999, MANN publishes the hockey stick graph in MBH99. It flattens the MWP

By September I, 1999 (or earlier) MANN is appointed Lead Author of Chapter 2, "Observed

(who is embroiled in his own hockey stick fiasco; see {BRIFFA'S YAMAL 26.Sep.2009}). For

ckey stick was not used in the 2007 report, but the players remain the same, with

an explanation of manipulations in this graph, see [36]; for explanations of other tampering

BRIFFA taking over from MANN, as explained by MCINTYRE in "IPCC AR4" [56]:

and a close-up [60], see {HOW TO: 5.Oct.1999} and {MANN 1.Sep.1999}.

A, and then turns dramatically skyward to make it appear that temperatures were

Variability and Change," of the IPCC 2001 report, which substitutes Mann's hockey

The AND MCKITPICK N. 2003

wn here) for Lamb's 1990 graph. The hockey stick is featured prominently on pa

s is irrelevant. What is relevant is [sic] reproducible results. The greatest scientists in history precisely because they broke with the consensus. "There is no such thing as consensus science. If it's consensus, it isn't science. If it's science, it isn't onsensus. Period." [145]. (A year later, Crichton's novel State of Fear is published.) THIRD IPCC ASSESSMENT REPORT (TAR): THE HOCKEY STICK ARRIVES ON STAC In its 1990 report, the IPCC used the temperature graph created by Hubert Lamb, CRU's

ector [125], which showed the Medieval Warm Period 1000 years earlier and the Age 300 years earlier. Both the MWP and LIA were global phenomena, and a ma or the CO2/man-made global warming theory. The hockey team needed to

Hemisphere Temperatures Over The Past Millennium: Where Are The D'arrigo, BRADLEY, and possibly JONES and MANN. "[W]hat I am suggesting is strictly an empirical comparison of published I 000 year NH [northern hemisphere] reconstructions..." "I think this is exactly the kind of study that needs to be done before the next IPCC [2007] assessment." sts a range of topics, including "Describe the past work (Mann. Briffa." so it could be correct, but could be very wrong as well. Crowley, Esper, yada, yada, yada) and their data overlaps," and ends with th conclusion he says the paper will come to (note: expletives partially redacted): Vithout trying to prejudice this work, but also because of what I almost think I know to be the case, the results of this study will show that we can probably say a fair bit about <100 year extra-tropical NH temperature variability (at least as far as we elieve the proxy estimates), **but honestly know f**k-all about what the >100** rariability was like with any certainty (i.e. we know with certainty that we know f**k-all)." [1062592331.txt]

OK: WE KNOW FOR CERTAIN WE KNOW NOTHING ABOUT

COOK e-mails BRIFFA with a suggestion for a new paper, "Northern

TEMPERATURES BEFORE 1900

WITH RUSSIAN CLIMATE DATA Climate Change ... had probably tampered with Russian-climate data.""

Over 40% of Russian territory was not included in global-temperature calculations..." ts say climatologists use the data of stations located in large þ

DECEMBER 2009: "'Climategate has already affected Russia.... [T]he Moscow-based stitute of Economic Analysis (IEA) issued a report claiming that the Hadley Center for "'Analysts say Russian meteorological stations cover most of the country's territory, and that e Hadley Center had used data submitted by only 25% of such stations in its reports. ow any substantial warming in the late 20th century and the early 21st century.

suggest that authors in the area of paleoclimate studies are closely connected and thus 'independent studies' may not be as independent as they might appear on the surface.... important to note the isolation of the paleoclimate community; even ecessarily independent. [See {JONES 5.Aug.2009} and {JONES 26.Feb.2004}] ver, the work has been sufficiently politicized that this community can ha

WEGMAN REPORT: MCINTYRE AND MCKITRICK RIGHT, MANN WRONG

involved in the global-warming debate after the energy and commer

n general, we found MBH98 and MBH99 [by Mann et al.] to b

"In our further exploration of the social network of authorships in temper

nmittee on Applied and Theoretical Statistics, and board member of the American

Statistics at George Mason University, chair of the National Academy of Sciences'

Statistical Association. Few statisticians in the world have CVs to rival his...'

THE COMMITTEE'S FINDINGS (SUMMARIZED):

McKitrick] to be valid and compelling....

entirely vindicated the Canadian critics and repudiated Mann's work." [113] the authors and reviewers who were listed t and incomplete and the criticisms of MM03/05a/05b [McIntyre and Remove the duplications and the total number of authors viewers drops from 3,750 to 2,890.... ortantly, the great majority of the review reconstruction, we found that at least 43 authors have direct ties to Dr. Mann d on chapters that dealt with historical or tech by virtue of coauthored papers with him. Our findings from this analysis he exception was Chapter 9 - Understanding and individuals, four commented favourably on th ntire chapter and three on a portion of the pter." "The 53 authors and seven favourabl eviewers represent a total of 60 people, leading an to conclude: 'There is only evidence th

DURTH IPCC ASSESSMENT REPORT (AR4) AND

Dr. William Schlesinger: Approximately 80% of IPCC

Rudd [Prime Minister of Australia], in ma

ENATIONAL POST, "NUMBERS RACKET," BY

This is the conclusion of 4,000 scientists appointed b

IPCC'S "4,000 SCIENTISTS"

scientists do not deal with climate. [84]

case that the planet is in peril....

MCINTYRE discovers errors in the GISS data forcing HANSEN "to publish revised figures for US surface temperatures to show that the hottest years of th entury were not in the 1990s, as Hansen had claimed, but in the 1930 [before the record CO2 emissions of the post-war economic boom].... teve McIntyre, a Canadian computer analyst, had noticed that Hansen had usting his pre-1970 global temperature figures downwards by as m test on record - despite widespread evidence of blummeting temi etailed analysis by McIntyre and Anthony Watts, a US meteorologist, showed at scores of temperature records from Russia and elsewhere had not been based on October readings. GISS revised its figures once more, explaining that the Russian data had been obtained by another body." [51]

MCINTYRE DISCOVERS ERRORS IN GISS DATASET, HANSEN ADMITS

1930s WERE U.S.A's. HOTTEST YEARS IN 20TH CENTURY

CRU e-mails have revealed how the normal conventions of the peer review process

eam spent nearly a year preparing and publishing a paper that attempted to rebut a

significant "global warming" in fact largely disagreed with the observational data." [14/]

magazine New Scientist readies two editorials critical of the IPCC.

mate chapter in 2007 IPCC Report) gets pre-publication copies, and e-

IARD DOMERVILLE, inviting the other CLA's to join a campaign

N: "My suggestion is that a strongly worded letter to New Scientist, signed by

article, about which MANN tells IONES: "New Scientist was god

both had some input into that. They are nicely dismissive of the contrarians

ng dealt with Climate Research and Geophysical Research Letters,

ANTER turn to Weather, a journal of the Royal

ed about him to the RMS Chief Exec. If I don't get him

yn, I won't be sending any more papers to any RMS

NTER: "If the RMS is going to require authors to make ALL data

calculations - I will not submit any further papers to RMS journals."

ils and I'll be resigning from the RMS."

This file appears to be a CRU programmer's three year journal of his efforts to try and recreate CRU's own results produced by

ack years. The CRU at East Anglia University is considered by many as the world's leading climate research agency " [21]

tware written by MITCHELL. Despite having access to all the data, CRU's code, and the people who developed it and the mod

presumably precise data are the backbone of climate science. Reading 'HARRY READ ME.txt' it's clear the CRU's files were a mess. The

Back to the gridding. I am seriously worried that **our flagship gridded data product** is produced by Delaunay triangulation - apparently

r as well. As far as I can see, this renders the station counts totally meaningless. It also means that we cannot say exactly how

Well, dtr2cld is not the world's most complicated program. Wheras cloudreg is, and I immediately found a mistake! ... a loop that, for completely

veather station) cannot start in 1962, it didn't open until 1993!... Getting seriously fed up with the state of the Australian

Organization) codes!! But what else is there in such situations? Especially when dealing with a 'Master' database of dubious provenance

Decided to read [Tim] Mitchell & Jones 2005 [International Journal of Climatology] again. Noticed that the limit for SD when

Right, time to stop pussyfooting around the niceties of Tim's [MITCHELL] labyrinthine software suites - let's have a go at

JONES [to "Mike, Ray, Caspar"]: "2. You can delete this

tachment if you want. Keep this quiet also, but this is the pe

] have written and received re Ch 6 of AR

o is putting in FOI requests for all emails Keith [BRIFFA] and 1

We think we've found a way around this." [1210367056.tx

NTER: I'LL QUIT IF LLNL FORCES ME TO DISCLOS

SANTER at Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory says

h their full support. If they do not, I'm fully prepared to s

g should be 4 for precip, not 3! So re-ran with that ... got a mail from PJ [JONES] to say we shouldn't be excluding stations

e IPCC 2007 report) discharge their duties,

is proceeds as follows: May 6 - (

A and OSBORN were lead authors

words what CRU usually do. It will allow bad databases to pass unnoticed, and good databases to become bad.

nside 8km anyway - yet that's in IIC [International Journal of Climatology] - Mitchell & Jones 2005! So there you go.

this renders the (weather) station counts totally meaningless.... COBAR AIRPORT AWS (data from an Australian

are based on results the CRU can not duplicate. From Botch After

available - raw data PLUS results from all intermediate

ist about every point, including the HS!" [1179416790.txt]

iously published paper in IJC ... [which] had shown that the IPCC models that predi

ppear to have been compromised by a team* of global warming scientists, with the willing

ooperation of the editor of the International Journal of Climatology (IJC), Glenn McGregor. The

IONES and FOSTER (copies to TRENBERTH, MANN, SALINGER, SCHMIDT, and

Research requires for a paper he's submitted. They recommend colleagues who

FOSTER: "3) Suggested Reviewers to Include

thers) discuss FOSTER'S recommendations for reviewers the Journal of Geophysi

the sorts of things to say," despite JGR's rules (actually quoted in the e-mail) oit this. See {WEGMAN REPORT 14.Jul.2006}.

e list the names of 5 experts who are knowledgeable in your area and could give ar

I review of your work. Please do not list colleagues who are close

ssociates, collaborators, or family members (this requires name, email, and institution

Aike Wallace may not be responsive to requests from JGR. We have Ben Santer in

omment and the awful original, without any prompting." [1249503274.txt]

on! Dave Thompson is a good suggestion. I'd go for one of Tom Peterson or Dave

g. To get a spread, I'd go with 3 US, One Australian and one in Europe. So Ne

l Parker. All of them know the sorts of things to say - about our

MCINTYRE NOT TO BE TRUSTED; EVEN PEER REVIEW

WORK WILL ONLY BE PUBLISHED IN "DISCREDITED" JOURN

MANN to Revkin (NY TIMES): "[M]ore likely he [McIntyre] won't su

discredited contrarian home journal 'Energy and Environment."

peer-reviewed scrutiny, or if it does get his criticism 'published' it wi

ary though not in general sufficient condition for taking a sc

cess. IT hose such as McIntyre who operate

ntirely outside of this system are not to be trusted.'

/IGLEY: BRIFFA IS IN A MESS OVER YAMAL

tough time explaining his way out of it:

nmediately after the Yamal issue breaks, WIGLEY admits BRIFFA is going to have

Keith explain the McIntyre plot that compares Yamal-12 with Yamal-all? And

chronology rather that the later (better replicated) chronology?... Perhaps these

ow does he explain the apparent 'selection' of the less well-replicated

as he is too close to the issue and probably quite pissed of [sic].

LEY: "But Keith does seem to have got himself into a mess." "[H]ow does

in be explained clearly and concisely — but I am not sure Keith [Briffa] is able to do

explained on wattsupwiththat.com: "Many of [JONES'] points about problems with the NASA

lucts we've covered here on WUWT and at Climate Audit." "Here's the thing, we've seen the

asterling [5] < David. Easterling@xxxxxxxxxxxxxx NCDC"

ok too hot." Later: "Yeah, it wasn't so much 1998 and all ossibility that we might be going through a longer last few points off the filtered curve before I give the

and others discuss the BBC article, WIGLEY rebukes MANN ally been quite stable since 2000 or so and 2008 doesn't WIGLEY: "The Figure you sent is very deceptive. As an ex again as that's trending down as a result of the end least here I can assess how sensitive matches are to sensitivity and fects and the recent cold-ish years." [1225026120.txt] assumptions/uncertainties." 1255558867.txt]

oducing a deceptive chart, and notes dishonest presentat historical runs with PCM look as though they match observations -

"The Met Office's published data showing a warming trend draws heavily on CRU analysis CRU supplied all the land temperature data to the Met Office, which added this to its own analysis of sea temperature data." [31]

1ENTS MADE PUBLIC ON THE INTERNET $\, [$ JEA DENIES MCINTYRE'S FOI REQUEST

Director of Information Services at the University of East Anglia [sends a le o Steve McIntyre refusing his request for temperature data under the UK's version reedom of Information Act. The timing of the denial, which was a day after the I

rist Horner, for the Competitive Enterprise Institute, "filed three tices of Intent to File Suit against NASA and its Goddard Institute for S Studies (GISS), for those bodies' **refusal - for nearly three years** - to provide

MUS E. BENESTAD: senior scientist: Norwegian Meteorological

RAYMOND BRADLEY: director: Climate System Research Cent

TIMOTHY CARTER: senior researcher: Finnish Environme

EDWARD R. COOK: director of Lamont-Doherty Earth

of Arizona (USA); co-author of the hockey stick graph.

GRANT FOSTER: chief scientist: Island Data Corporation (USA).

STEVEN MCINTYRE: mathematician and mining expert; founder

IONATHAN OVERPECK: director: Institute for the Study of

SS MCKITRICK: professor of economics: University of Guelph

n, University of Arizona (USA); coordinating lead author o

EIL PLUMMER: climatologist: National Climate Centre Bureau o

TEFAN RAHMSTORF: professor of [oceanic] physics: University

Potsdam (DE); co-founder of realclimate.org. [105]

JIM SALINGER: climate change scientist; lead author of the 2007

BENJAMIN SANTER: statistician: Lawrence Livermore National

TEPHEN SCHNEIDER: professior of environmental biolog

change: Standord University (USA); contributor to all four

ipps Institution of Oceanography (USA); coordinating lead author

RICHARD SOMERVILLE: professor emeritus, research professor:

RIC J. STEIG: director of Quaternary Research Center: Univer-

of Washington (USA); co-founder of realclimate.org. [103]

Observatory Tree-Ring Laboratory (USA).

chapter, 2007 IPCC report. [101]

paleoclimate chapter, 2007 IPCC report.

of the 2007 IPCC report. [100]

AMES HANSEN becomes Director of NASA Goddard Institute for Space

he still holds, and shortly thereafter publishes GISS' first global to

lysis, "Climate Impact of Increasing Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide," in the jou

SEN in the late 1970s. [18] The GISS global temperature record is of

emperature records now used by the IPCC, the primary being the

'owever, both obtain most of their raw data from NOAA's GHCN dataset. [50]

ry about alleged man-made global warming on August 22, 1981. [5] [152]

of Increasing Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide," Earth:

ce. The basic temperature analysis scheme published and used by GISS was def

According to a graph (shown) in HANSEN'S 1981 paper "Climate Impact

) Warmed from 1880 to 1940 (60 years), before any significant man-ma

Cooled from 1940 to 1980 (40 years), despite the greates

Earth was again undergoing warming, and that CO2 was to blame. How

970s, when his own data didn't show it? Only years later, once a

eriod. Was this a coincidence? Was HANSEN lucky? Are we to bel

seeming trend had set in, was it declared that Earth was in a warming

than a decade now (despite ever-higher levels of atmospheric CO2

Or is it as Syun-Ichi Akasofu, former director of the world-leading

supercomputer, no matter how powerful, is able to prove definitively a simpli

n fact, after 12 years of cooling, one hockey stick researcher flatly s

hypothesis that says the greenhouse effect is responsible for warming." [92]

Yet, while only a handful of scientists agreed with the 1979 confere

other points of view, and championed Hansen's CO2 induced

giving him front-page billing. Why?

V YORK TIMES: WARMING FROM CO2

ne year after headlining cooling, the New York

ms of the CO2-induced global warming

debate: "[By] the time we were certain that a

ons or HANSEN'S 1981 position, the news media igno

International Arctic Research Center at the University of Alaska

author of over 500 articles, explained in September 2007: "[N]

low could HANSEN have predicted a warming trend at this time, the late

AMES HANSEN HAS A GOOD YEAR

climateaudit.org. [164]

Iniversity of Massachusetts (USA); co-author of the hockey stick

Institute; lead author of the 1995, 2001, and 2007 IPCC reports. [99]

WILLIAM CONNOLLEY: former climate modeler [102]; co-founder

ALCOLM HUGHES: professor of dendrochronology: University

sibility to bring that about?" -- MAURICE STRONG (1990), founder of the UN The [observed] data don't matter' ... 'The data don't matter' ... 'Besides, we're not basing them upon computer models." -- CHRIS FOLLAND (1991) of the UK Met Office. [162]

nounce disasters no one will listen." -- JOHN HOUGHTON (1994), first co-cha. passed through a very expensive machine, is somehow ennobled and no one dares criticise "There is no opinion, however absurd, which men will not readily embrace as soon as they can b brought to the conviction that it is generally adopted." -- ARTHUR SCHOPENHAUER [163]

warming crisis. The time for debate is over. The 7% thought global warming had begun." [80] GREENPEACE POLL: "47% of climatologists didn't think "Nothing is more obstinate than a fashionable consensus." -- MARGARET THATCHER [163] and a myth-generating machine." [90] [135] Also see {CRICHTON 17.Jan.2003}.

DIEVAL WARM PERIOD: "WE HAVE TO GET RID OF IT"

or problem for the Anthropogenic (i.e., Man-made) Global Warming theory is

peratures were much warmer than today's. Indeed "more than 700 scientists from 40

neters at the time of Fric the Red, this gives us a benchmark for reference. In fact, t

hsonian reports that there is evidence which supports the theory that the Viking colonies late

reenland" [86].) Clearly these high MWP temperatures could not have been due to

rming is anomalous. In addition, there was the 3,000 year Holocene

ım of 7,000 years ago when temperatures were also significantly higher than today's

the hockey team needed to erase them. With reference to this, David Deming, a

ture graph from the 1990 IPCC report with the one in the 2001 IPCC report (see

[1999] and {IPCC 2001}). The 2001 report used MANN'S now discredited hockey

ck graph that flattened the MWP and LIA to make it appear that modern global

nan the 1961-90 mean. **This is all gut feeling, no science....**" [1098472400.txt]

rm peak in 1940 was another obstacle for AGW theorists, since it occurred before

J software (see {HOW TO HIDE 7.Sep. 1998}) to "Apply a VERY ARTIFICIAL correction for

lecline" appears to reveal the CRU's method for erasing the problem: The recorded peak

was artificially lowered, and subsequent temperatures hiked. [153]

ian-made CO2 emissions (see {GRAPH 1981}). A programmer's notation in

s in 40 countries have contributed to peer-reviewed papers providing evidence that th

Warm Period, which the IPCC has tried to deny, was real, global, and warmer than the

WP, Chaucer spoke of vineyards in northern England [128] [129]. "All over the

sult of a dramatically cooling climate." [78] (To learn more, see "On the Viking

al Warm Period of a thousand years ago. The MWP was a time when globa

GORE'S CONSENSUS?

E WANG AFFAIR AND JONES' URBAN HEAT ISLAND EFFECT PAPER [48] DNES is the lead author of a September, 1990 paper that concludes there is no relevant urban heat island effect (i.e., present." [94] (Also see [63] and graphs [top 26, middle 36, bottom 64].) ocalized temperature increase) in and around urban centers. [46]. However, 3 months later, his co-author Wei-Chyung √ang publishes another paper using the very same Eastern China data, concluding that there is a significant UHI effect d temperature studies must this take into account to avoid skewing results in favor of warming. [47] (Also see allegedly derives were chosen because of a supposed history of "few, if any, changes in r 49 stations. IONES replies that Wang "selected the stations ... based on his 'extensive knowledge of those networks.'" [48] enan writes to Wang, who replies that Zhao-Mei Zeng (a co-author of [47]) has "*hard copies of station historie*s owever, the authors, including Zeng, of a U.S. Department of Energy and Chinese Academy of Sciences study detailing tation moves note that the copies to which Wang referred were "'not currently available."" [49] [138] [123]. Together, the HC, MWP, and LIA show that global temperatures fluctuate several degrees from natural causes with no ill-effects.

er in 2007 Keenan publishes "The Fraud Allegation Against Some Climatic Research of Wei-Chyung Wang," setti tations in China (at Beijing and at Shanghai). This study correctly describes how the stations ha s, and it concludes that those relocations substantially affected the measured temperatures-in direct contradiction to the laims of Wang. Thus, by 2001, Jones must have known that the claims of Wang were not wholly true." [49] he [1990 JONES et al] paper has been the major evidence presented by JONES in allof the IPCC reports to ismiss the influence of urban change on the temperature measurements, and also has been used as an excuse least) must have known at the time that they were incorrect." [1188557698.txt] [1241415427.txt

f human activity. Global warming, an issue that has received much tention this past year, is an important element of this Program." rer, global warming has occurred in pre-industrial eras. tial for future global warming, and the relative research activities totals \$133.9 million." [| ent will have poured in \$32 billion for climate research—and \$36 billion for development of climate-related technologies." ET OFFICE ESTABLISHES HADLEY CENTRE FOR CLIMATE EDICTION: HAS CLOSE TIES WITH IPCC AND CRU

iumbed when the stations dropped out [see grap iggesting that it was mainly the colder stations that wei o longer in the record." [173:1] "Smith says after awhile [sic], it became clear this t a random strange þattern he wa: ometers moved from cold mountains to wo iches: from Siberian Arctic to more southerly locate

r major station dropout." "Programmer E.M. Smith analysis of NOAA's GHCN found they

temperatures were unusually high.

GEST NON-FINANCIAL COMMODITY n emissions have been traded, albeit at minor levels, in the over-the-counter (OTC) ma e the 1990s." [134] "According to the World Bank, turnover of carbon trading doubled from \$63 billion in 2007 to \$126 billion in 2008." [131:1] hilton, head of the energy and environmental markets advisory committee of the Commo es Trading Commission ... has predicted that within five years a carbon market would dwarf any ets his agency currently regulates: 'I can see carbon trading being a \$2 trillion market.' e largest commodity market in the world."' [131:1] rd L. Sandor, chairman and chief executive officer of Climate Exchange Plc, which tience. If there is no evidence that we need to curtail carbon, there is no need t

The real shape of the last 2000 years

which he summarizes the NRC's skeptic

EE RINGS LESS THAN 50% RELIABLE FOR DETERMINING PAST TEMPERATURE [ONES [0839858862.txt]: "I am disturbed by how me people in the paleo community try to overse eir product.... Climate variance explained I the proxy variable--close to zero for ice cor towards "the ability of proxies to detect warmir above the level of a millennium ago." Alley mention that "one of the committee members was asking eac nswering with some aualified version of 'no.'"

rings for determining temperature.

"In his effort to correlate the data Dr. Wigley letters to Nature etc etc? I think we shoul

oncludes that the solar signal is strong enough have a cunning plan about what to do this

year, simply to avoid a lot of wasted time....

[IPCC lead author and Australian Met Bureau

s, from the IPCC perspective, is that carbon emissions were a lot lower." [124:1] apitalism clearly ruins everything." [124:1] (See also [143] [144].)

summarizes the many problems with using tre

being motivated by pre-conceived agendas and being scientifically unsound." [55]

U.N. declared global warming to be a scientific fact." [16

ideological exercise. In March 1998, Mike Hulme received a draft version [0889554019.txt] of t oduced a lot of carbon emissions ... The alternatives were variations on slower growth.... bshot of these scenarios, based on IPCC objectives of reducing carbon emission, is a acked against free markets and globalization. In the [ClimateGate] emails, the scena ir way through a barrage of comment from scientists who, for the most part, balk at the process. In a complete surprise to many that scenarios should have a relationship to reality d. Mike Hulme appeared as one of the contributing authors for the IPCC's 2001 Synthesis Re rious 100-year scenarios. It concluded that carbon concentration in the atmosphere could ris re the pre-industrial year of 1750 under the free market A1 scenario, with temperatures rising

RBON ECONOMICS 2: A STACKED DECK AGAINST ECONOMIC PROGRESS

ence Corcoran explains in "Climategate Part I - A 2,000-page epic of science and

in an appropriate manner following discussion in Madrid." [14]

warm patch

FACTOR: RESULTS SUPPRESSED

forcing.' [0839858862.txt]

MAY 8, 2007: Neptune warming steadily from 1980 to 2004. [97]

400 prominent scientists from more than two dozen countries recently voiced significant objections to major aspects of the so-called 'consensus' on man-made global warming. These scientists, many of whom are current and former participe

• Christopher W. Landsea, IPCC author and reviewer, atmospheric scientist, and hurricane expert with NOAA's National Hurricane Center, who resigned from the IPCC Fourth Assessment Report, charging the UN with

falsifying hurricane science: "I am withdrawing because I have come to view the part of the IPCC to which my expertise is relevant as having become politicized.... I personally cannot in good faith continue to contribute to a process that I view as both

• Andrei Kapitsa, Russian geographer and Antarctic ice core researcher: "A large number of critical documents submitted at the 1995 U.N. conference in Madrid vanished without a trace. As a result, the discussion was one-sided and he

e UN IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change), criticized the climate claims made by the UN IPCC ..." [55] [ClimateGate lets the public understand why scientists made the following comments back in 2007 or earlier.]

their hockey stick paper (MBH98) in GLOBAL WARMING ALSO ON TRITON, NEPTUNE, MARS UNE 24, 1998: Global warming on Neptune's largest moon, Triton. [95] ANUARY 26, 2007: Simultaneous global warming on Mars and Earth. [9

PETITION: "NO CONVINCING SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE" OF AGW: BY 2010, 31,486 SCIENTISTS SIGN

settled' - that an overwhelming 'consensus' of scientists agrees with the hypothesis of human-caused global warming, with

scientists who have signed, 3,804 are trained in atmospheric, environmental, and Earth sciences; 935

des 15-times more scientists than are seriously involved in the United Nations IPCC process." [154:1] Of 31,486

Petition Project is initiated in response to claims by Mr. Gore, the IPCC and others at Kyoto the "'s*cienc*

nly a handful of skeptical scientists in disagreement." "In PhD scientist signers alone [more than 9,000], the project already

-1.00 1000 1400 1600 1800 2000

ANN, BRADLEY and HUGHES republish their hockey stick in Geophysic arch Letters (GRL) (MBH99). This time, however, the hockey stick goes to year 1000, and flattens both the Medieval Warm Period and Little Ice Age. [44] By September, 1999 (or earlier), MANN is appointed Lead Author of Chapter erved Climate Variability and Change," of the IPCC 2001 report, which prominently features MANN'S hockey stick on page 3 (see {IPCC 2001}). November, 2003, MANN'S hockey stick is discredited (see {MCINTYRE AND ITRICK Nov.2003}). However, the graph had become the de facto "proof purported catastrophic CO2 induced man-made climate change. The hockey ick is not used 4 years later in the 2007 report.

e modeler and realclimate.org co-founder William] Connolley took control of all things climat

position to the claims of the band members were beginning to gel. Connolley set to work (

ised information source the world has ever known — Wikipedia. Starting in February 2003, j

site. He rewrote Wikipedia's articles on global warming, on the greenhouse effe

strumental temperature record, on the urban heat island, on climate models, o

Dling. On Feb. 14, he began to erase the Little Ice Age; on Aug. 11, the Med

hers that the band especially hated, such as Willie Soon and Sallie Baliunas of the Harvard-Smithsonian

administrative status at Wikipedia that enabled him to delete 'over 500 articles' and 'barred'

ninistrator status was revoked by Wikipedia in September, 2009 for his involvement in an

Center for Astrophysics, authorities on the Medieval Warm Period." [109] (Also see [111].)

more than 2000 Wikipedia contributors who 'ran afoul of him.'" [110] CONNOLLEY'S

1ANN e-mails JONES, HUGHES, BRIFFA, BRADLEY and others explaining

h in peer review journals. However, now that Climate Research is

hing their papers, he suggests that he and his colleagues no longer cit

II along, the plan was to insist that those against the AGW th

s from it or submit papers to it, while Jones says he'll boycott 't get a new editor. See [79] for full details.

hand, the team insists opposing views be aired in peer

See {SUN DETERMINED 9.Aug.1996}.)

currently sit on the editorial board..."

this case a Willie Soon & Sallie Baliunas paper that "io

1ANN: "They've already achieved what they wanted—the claim of a beer-reviewe

ber. There is nothing we can do about that now, but the last thing we want to

ring attention to this paper, which will be ignored by the community on the wh

use of climate change as 'solar forcing,' not carbon dioxide (CO2)." [169]

his was the danger of always criticising the skeptics for not publishing

the 'peer-reviewed literature'. Obviously, they found a solution to that--take

our colleagues in the climate research communit nit to, or cite papers in, this journal. We would a

consider what we tell or request of our more reasonable colleagues wh

JONES: "I will be emailing the journal to tell them I'm having nothing

editor assigned by Hans von Storch." [1047388489.txt]

nore to do with it until they rid themselves of this troublesome editor. A

STICK AUTHOR: OUR WORK SHOULD BE CONSID

MBH99), expresses reservations about over-reliance on their invention

nperatures for the period around 1000 years ago are based on far

PRELIMINARY AND TREATED WITH CONSIDERABLE CAUTION

HUGHES, a co-author of the original hockey stick papers (MBH98 &

HUGHES: "All of our attempts, so far, to estimate hemisphere-scale

ore, I accept that everything we are doing is preliminar

lata than any of us would like. None of the

"Connolley 'created or rewrote 5,428 unique Wikipedia articles' and was granted a senior editor

d I make the data available to you, when your aim is to try and find something v ourpose of replication is to 'try and find something wrong'... Then the story changed. In June 2009, Georgia Tech's Peter Webster told Canad researcher Stephen McIntyre that he had requested raw data, and Jones freely g So McIntyre promptly filed a Freedom of Information Act request for the same data having been invited by the National Academy of Sciences to present his analyses of illennial temperatures, McIntyre was told that he couldn't have the data because he wasn an 'academic.' So his colleague Ross McKitrick, an economist at the University of Guelph, asked for the data. He was turned down, too." [27]

MICHAEL CRICHTON AT CALTECH: IN SCIENCE CONSENSUS IS IRRELEVANT want to pause here and talk about this notion of consensus, and the rise of what has been called nsensus science. I regard consensus science as an extremely pernicious development that ough e stopped cold in its tracks. Historically, the claim of consensus has been the first refuge of scoundrels; t is a way to avoid debate by claiming that the matter is already settled. Whenever you hear the consensus of scientists agrees on something or other, reach for your wallet, because you're being had. "Let's be clear: the work of science has nothing whatever to do with consensus. Consensus is the ousiness of politics. Science, on the contrary, requires only one investigator who happens to be right,

tronomical Union [2004] concluded

OOK asks BRIFFA for help to put down a paper

to review (submitted to the Journal of Agricultural,

OUST EDITORS THAT PUBLISH PAPERS YOU DON'T LIKE

ney don't agree with [1051190249.txt]:

WIGLEY explains to IONES, HULME and CARTER strategies for

usting the editor of Climate Research, which has published papers

le the specifics of the editoring. Hans von Storch is partly to blame – he

ord 'berceived' here, since whether it is true or n

ot what the publishers care about -- it is how the journal is

at I am copying this view only to Mike Hulme and Phil Jones.

not work -- must get rid of von Storch too, ot

happy with von Storch, so the above approach

seen by the community that counts. I think we could get a larg

group of highly credentialed scientists to sign such a letter – 50+ people.

Nike's idea to get editorial board members to resign will

remove that hurdle too." (Von Storch subsequently resigns.)

ANTER, TRENBERTH, WILBY, MANN, KARL and 20 o

pear in scientific publications, even if the papers pass peer review

ALINGER: "Ignoring bad science eventually reinforces the apparent 'truth' of the

plished by CR is used by the sceptics' lobbies to 'prove' that there is no ne

oncern over climate change. Since the IPCC makes it quite clear that there are

nce in the public mind, if it is not corrected. As importantly, the 'bad sci

OOK: WE KNOW OF PROBABLE FLAWS IN MANN'S WORK

BRIFFA: "I have just read this lettter - and I think it is crap. I am sick to death

of Mann stating his reconstruction represents the tropical area just

cause it contains a few (poorly temperature representative)

bonse is also why I chose not to read the published version of his letter. It wou

unwilling to evaluate his own work a bit more objectively." [1024334440.txt]

be too aggravating.... It is puzzling to me that a guy as bright as Mike would be so

YRE AND MCKITRICK EXPOSE HOCKEY STICK FLAW

ections to the Mann et al. (1998) Proxy Data Base and Northe

Hemisphere Average Temperature Series," (MM03) in Energy & Environme

ctober, 2004 WIGLEY reads MM03 and e-mails JONES he thinks

lot of it seems valid to me. At the very least MBH is a very sloppy piece of wor

he graph from MM03 highlights the result after MANN'S hockey stick is

d (1400-1500) are restored (see {WEGMAN 14.Jul.2006}).

oves MANN'S hockey stick is statistically invalid (i.e. t

TRICK publish more papers (following further disclosures ab

Mann) they claim "are a definitive resolution of issues first raised in MM03." [5

strigue the M&M paper unleashed, see [53]. In 2005, MCINTYRE as

cted. Specifically, high temperatures at the end of the Medieval

NN'S paper is very sloppy: "I have just read the M&M stuff critcizing MBH.

n opinion I have held for some time. Presumably what you have done with Keith is

explanation of the MCINTYRE and MCKITRICK paper a

ONES: WE'VE GOT 25 YEARS WORK IN THE DATA; WHY SHOULD I GIVE

his data and methods. From "The Dog Ate Global Warming" by Patrick J. Michaels:

ONES, whose research is publicly funded, claims ownership when asked to disclose

Warwick Hughes, an Australian scientist, wondered where that '+/-' came from, so he politely

Jones in early 2005, asking for the original data. Jones's response to a fellow scientist

e data, obsolete data, geographical location errors, inc

the "collation errors, unjustifiable truncation or extrapolation

WIGLEY: MANN'S 1998 PAPER "IS A VERY SLOPPY PIECE OF WORK"

EVEN MCINTYRE and ROSS MCKITRICK publish their first p

in MANN'S MBH98 hockey stick graph. [37]

better? - or is it? I get asked about this a lot." [1098472400.txt]

BRIFFA is "sick to death" of MANN'S representations about his

background on MANN'S work:

9.Apr. 1999) and {MCINTYRE AND MCKITRICK Nov.2003} for

K: "Review- confidential REALLY URGENT" -

rible etc They use your Tornetrask recon

e main whipping boy.... If published as is,

per could really do some damage. It is also

ing, editing, and submitting, and leave it

he right person with the one just received.

MANN confirms DEMING'S 1995 statement. See {MEDIEVAL

WARM PERIOD 1995, when he (MANN) refers to an earlier

MANN: "... addresses a good earlier point that Peck made v

See {MEDIEVAL WARM PERIOD 1995}, {IPCC 1990}, and {IPCC

01} to understand how critically important this admission is.

temperature period used by the IPCC. JONES explains that

LUMMER doesn't want to change it from the 1961

because global warming won't appear as dramatic

asier to compute. Personally I don't want

FIRST CONTACT WITH FOI: THE SCHEMING STARTS

PLUMMER: "There is a preference in the atmospheric observation

chapter of IPCC AR4 to stay with the 1961-1990 normals. This is

change the base period till after I retire!"

partly because a change of normals confuses users, e.ş

anomalies will seem less positive than before if we

ONES: "20 years (1981-2000) isn't 30 years, but the rationale

regard to the memo, that it would be nice to try to 'contain

"Peck" memo to "contain" the MWP:

the putative 'MWP' ... " [1054736277.txt]

ES "REVIEWS" PAPER DEALING WITH HIS OWN WORK [1077829152.txt]:

NES to MIKE: "Just agreed to review a paper for GRL - it is absolute rubbish. It is having a go at

egion this person says has Urban Warming! So easy review to do. Sent Ben the Soon et al. paper and he

isk you something in CONFIDENCE - don't email around, especially not to Keith and Tim here. **Have yo**

RU temperature data - not the latest vesion, but the one you used in MBH98!! We added lots of data in for

who reviews these sorts of things. Says GRL hasn't a clue with editors or reviewers. By chance they seem to

e squeaky clean with discussing them with others. So forget this email when you rep

Now something to ask from you.... I got a paper

al, and Environmental Sciences), written by a

he's reviewing that is critical of BRIFFA'S own work: JONES: "Recently rejected two papers (one

reviews, hopefully successfully. If either appears

critized the quality of the review. After that, I

excluded from the IPCC report. See [81]

way [sic] into oblivion and disrepute." for more about what took place.)

IGHES, MANN, WIGLEY, BRADLEY, JONES, BRIFFA

ical Research Letters (GRL), which had been p

SCHMIDT discuss what to do about the jour

they don't like. Its editor James Saiers is

VIGLEY: "This is truly awful. GRL has gone downhill rapid

oving bad behavior here is very difficult. If you think that

operiences w/ both Saiers and potentially Mackwell [I

could be taken through the proper channels." [1106322460.txt]

'IN SCHMIDT, MIKE MANN, ERIC STEIG, WILLIAM

t, RASMUS BENESTAD, and CASPAR AMMAN

he debunked 'Hockey Stick'..." [73]:

OLLEY, STEFAN RAHMSTORF, RAY BRADLEY, Amy

ief, GRL] (I don't know him-he would seem to be con

here is a clear body of evidence that something is amis

MATE.ORG IS BORN

/what is going on here).

CONGRESS QUESTIONS IPCC ABOUT MANN'S METHODS

validity of MANN'S hockey stick graph, and the

Statistician Francis Zwiers of Environment

Canada (a government agency) notes that Mr.

loe Barton and Ed Whitfield, Chairmen, Subcommittee on Oversight and Investigations, officiall

information necessary to replicate the analyses in the studies has not been made fully

This raises serious questions for their committee: "[O]ne concern relates to whether IPCC

er that assessed and reported this very same work, and that two co-authors of t

review has been sufficiently robust and independent. We understand that Dr. Michael

orals, etc.) formed the basis for a new finding in the 2001 [IPCC] Third Assessment Rep

ise the issue of MANN et al's "historical record of temperatures and climate change" with the IPCC

Environment, among others, researchers question the results of this work." They state this is particularly

an because "recent peer-reviewed articles in Science, Geophysical Research Letters, Energy &

s in the greenhouse skeptics camp, then, if

cent years. I think the decline began before Saiers..

dom of Information Acts. JONES' solution: Delete the data. MANN'S solution: Claim intellectual property rights: DETERMINED 9.Aug. 1996)). | ONES: "The two MMs [McIntyre and McKitrick] have been after the CRU station data for years. If they ever hear there is a Freedom of Information Act now in the UK, I think I'll **delete the file rather than send to anyone.** Does your similar ave a data protection act, which I w t it - thought beoble could ask him for his model code. **He** l retired officially from UEA so he can hide behind that. IPR d be relevant here, but I can see me getting into an argumen with someone at UEA who'll say we must adhere to it!" NN : "Yeah, there is a freedom of information act in the

he moment JONES and WIGLEY first become aware of the Freedom of Information Ac

from a UEA leaflet, they immediately start planning how to get around it [1106338806.txt]

VIGLEY: "I got a brochure on the FOI Act from UEA. Does this mean that, if someone asks for

ONES: "As you're no longer an employee I would use this argument if anything

nplified things. From their wording, computer code would be covered by the FOIA. My concern w

: "As for FOIA Sarah isn't technically employed by UEA and she will likely

overed by all the agreements we sign with people, so I will be hiding behind the

was still employed by UEA. I guess she could claim that she had only written one ter

omputer program we have to give it out?? Can you check this for me and Sarah?"

e on your face. – Kevin Vranes, Science Policy, 18 February 2005" "Mann's work doesn't meet that definition [of science], and those who use Mann's curve in their arguments are not making a scientific make up your data.' I will now add another Pournelle's Law: '**You can prov** anything if you can keep your algorithms secret.' – Jerry Pournelle, 18

who made us pay in the normals papers of Hulme et al. (1990s) and also any number that David can remember. This should also omit some ot ountries like (Australia, NZ, Canada, Antarctica). Also could extract some of th hat Anders added in (3 I-38 source codes in J&M 2003). Also should ι of the early stations that we coded up in the 1980s. ould annoy them." [jones-foiathoughts.doc]

WALL STREET JOURNAL, "CLIMATE OF FEAR: GLOBAL-WARMING ALARMISTS INTIMIL

ntists who dissent from the alarmism have seen their grant funds disappear, their work derided, and

the Royal Dutch Meteorological Society after questioning the scientific underpinnings of glo

ards in blace in scientific journals for articles submitted by those who raise questions about accepted clim

n. At Science and Nature, such papers are commonly refused without review.... However, even when su

ers are published, standards shift. When I, with some colleagues at NASA, attempted to determine how cloud

the form of letters to the journal to which the original authors can respond immediately. Howev

ANN confirms to JONES, BRIFFA, OSBORN that the GRL "leak has been plugged," but in an earlie

it allowed MCINTYRE to prominently display a poster at their recent meeting.

hip there, but these guys always have 'Climate Research' and 'Energy and Environment', o

ne same day notes that they have a problem with the U.S. Climate Change Science Program

way or another. The GRL leak may have been plugged up now wl new editorial

ave under varying temperatures, we discovered what we called an 'Iris Effect' ... Normally, criticism of papers ______ OPERATION NEW SCIENTIST MAGAZINE

ELATIONSHIPS TO CO2 "ARGUABLE"

ann et al. analysis was adjusted to reduce the positive slope in the last

emperature is perhaps a 'Pandora's box' that we might open at our peril!" [1163715685.txt]

Am I the first person to attempt to get the CRU databases in working order?!.

[HARRY_READ_ME.TXT (expletives partially deleted)]

nfathomable reasons, didn't include months!

NES advises KARL he may have convinced UEA to ignore FOI reques

ustralia are doing the same. They have cause to be fearful: MCINT

credited MANN'S hockey stick graph and later found errors forcing

d an email from David Jones of BMRC, Melbourne. He said t

om MCINTYRE (i.e. people with climateaudit.org (CA)) and that oth

IANSEN to revise NASA's GISS temperature record.

FOIA requests if the people have anything to do with Climate

NES: "I. Think I've managed to persuade UEA to ignore all

ENTING SCIENTISTS INTO SILENCE," BY RICHARD LINZDEN, ALFRED P. SLOAN

nselves libeled as industry stooges, scientific hacks or worse...." "Henk Tennekes was dismissed as res

PROFESSOR OF ATMOSPHERIC SCIENCE AT MIT:

OPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS ... MISSION ACCOMPLISHED

N: USE REALCLIMATE.ORG TO COMBAT "DISINFORMATIOI

"I've already given it a good go-over w/ Gavin, Stefan, and William

night want to visit the thread and post replies yourself. **We can hold**

also welcome to do a followup guest post, etc. think of RC as a resource

O HIDE COOLING: BURY IT IN THE SOFTWARE

APORTANT NOTE: The data after 1960 should not be used. The tree-ring

ave been modified to look more like the observed temperatures

beratures then (sic) they should be which will incorrectly imp

reconstruction is more skilful than it actually is. See Osborn et al.

acilitate calibration, THEREFORE, post-1960 values will be much clos

for years." "Let us not try to over-egg the pudding, he graph. The issue of why we don't

"Others, such as mxdgrid2ascii.pro, issue this warning:

scientific community would come only the 'same old evidence' that had been around

S HOCKEY STICKS, AND KEEP MUM ABOUT FREEDOM

NES: "Francis Zwiers is [s]till onside. He said that PCIs produ

ockey sticks.... The IPCC comes in for a lot of stick. Leave it to you to delet

JK has a Freedom of Information Act!" [1109021312.txt

e, but that MANN was refusing to disclose his meth-

uld have produced a healthy scientific debate. Instead, **Mr. Mann**

was forced to publish a retraction of some of his initial data, and doubts

tistical methods have since grown. – The Wall Street Journal, 18

tried to shut down debate by refusing to disclose the mathematical

algorithm by which he arrived at his conclusions. All the same, Mr.

comments up in the queue and contact you about whether or not

ou think they should be screened through or not, and if so, any

ts you'd like us to include.

ate from data4sweden.pro's last edit.)

(our internal "peer review" process at RC), so I think its in pretty good

3. Send them the raw data as is, by reconstructing it from [NASA's GISS **dataset known as] GHCN**. How could this be done? Replace all stations where WMO ID agrees with what is in GHCN. **This would be the raw data**, but it ITHONY WATTS COMMENCES HIS USHCN SURFACE STATIONS SURVEY: BY 2009, 650 VOLUNTEERS JOIN THE PROJECT The project aims to photographically survey all 1,221 USHCN weather stations that are used for the

that the twentieth century witnessed a statistically significant warming trend are unreliable." [132]

o use in scientific studies or as a basis for public policy decisions..." "The data currently used t

"2. Send them a subset removing station data from some of the cour

he will refuse information requests from MCINTYRE and viewing how to avoid FOI requests. A few days later s he'll leave LLNL if the management does not temperature record, the world's most "accurate." By spring 2009 over 70% of the network has been should respond to any FOI requests that we receive from red, and "89 percent of the stations ... fail to meet the National Weather Service's own siting requirements IcIntyre. I assume that such requests will be forthcomii [1226500291.txt] "I hope LLNL management will provide

ONES: EVERYONE DELETE E-MAILS RELATED TO IPCC AR4 mail regarding "IPCC & FOI", JONES instructs MANN to delete e-mai ed to the IPCC AR4 (2007). GENE, KEITH and CASPAR are to do th ons with UEA's FOI officer on May 9, 2008 MANN: "I'll contact Gene about this ASAP. His new email is:

DNES: I DELETED LOADS OF E-MAILS 2 MONTHS AGO

IONES: "When the FOI requests began here, the FOI person said we had to abide by the

equests. It took a couple of half hour sessions - one at a screen, to convin

n quite well and the Chief Librarian - who deals with appeals....

nem otherwise showing them what CA [climateaudit.org] was all about. O

n the registry and in the Environmental Sciences school - the hea

Canadian [McIntyre], saying that the email maligned his scientific credibility with

nd he can get anything I've written about him. About 2 months ago I deleted loads

of emails, so have very little - if anything at all." [1228330629.txt]

JONES' request is *after* the formal FOI request of May 5, 2008 and "Mike, Can you delete any emails you may have had with Keith re

W theory. 1940 has now been a thorn for 11 years (see {CRU

FWARE 7.Sep.1998}). WIGLEY: "It would be good to remove at least po

BBC: WHAT HAPPENED TO GLOBAL WARMING?

or the last 11 years we have not observed any increase in globo

ADMISSION: THE SUN AND/OR EL-NINO DRIVE CLIMATE

sunspots get over their temporary--presumed--vacation.

SCHNEIDER: "As we enter an El Nino year and as soon [sic], as the

here will **likely** be another dramatic upward spike like 1992-2000."

Note the conditional "likely," meaning no spike is also possible.

LEY: MANY DISHONEST IPCC PRESENTATIONS

When it comes to driving temperatures, the Sun is given cred

man-made carbon dioxide, the gas thought to be responsible for warming our planet, has continued to rise." [42]

emperatures. And our climate models did not forecast it, even though

1940s blip, but we are still left with 'why the blip.'" [1254108338.txt]

his. IPCC is exempt from any countries FOI - the skeptics have been told this. statement, aims etc) therefore we don't have an obligation to pass it on." [1219239172.txt] er 1940, the Earth cooled though CO2 went up -- in contradiction of

though we (MOHC, CRU/UFA) possibly hold relevant info the IPCC is not part our remit (miss

RE-EXAMINE 160 YEARS OF CLIMATE DATA

penhagen aimed at cutting CO2 emissions.

WIGLEY: SINCE 1980 LAND WARMING DOUBLE THAT OF OCE WIGLEY: "We probably need to say more about this. Land warming since 198 has been twice the ocean warming - and skeptics might claim that th proves that urban warming is real and important." [1257546975.txt]

LINE.CO.UK: UK MET OFFICE TO COMMENCE 3 YEAR PROJECT TO

NOTE: This requires the original raw data, which the CRU claims to have destroyed.]

in the science on man-made global warming has been shattered by leaker

e **new analysis of the data will take three years**, meaning that the Met Offic

e to state with absolute confidence the extent of the warming trend until the end o

he Met Office database is one of three main sources of temperature data analysis on wh

"The Government is attempting to stop the Met Office from carrying out the re-

"The Met Office works closely with the University of East Anglia's Climatic Research Unit (CR

which is being investigated after e-mails written by its director, Phil Jones, appeared to show c

examination, arguing that it would be seized upon by climate change sceptics.

attempt to manipulate temperature data and block alternative scientific views.

Net Office plans to re-examine 160 years of temperature data after admitting that publi

TRATE SKEPTICS' PEER REVIEW BIDS: MISSION ACCOMPL

thesized that global warming is likely to be modest. Others surely stoppe

ing, tiring of summary rejections of good work by editors scared o

OM "More evidence of gatekeeping" by Bishop Hill: "'It is exactly as we fe

NES: "You are probably aware of this, but the journal Sonja edits [Energ

entl is at the very bottom of almost all climate scientists lists o

don't seem to be bothering with journals at all recently." [1256765544

is the journal of choice of climate change skeptics and even here th

here ran into brick walls.'" [85]

TRENBERTH: WHERE THE HECK IS GLOBAL WARMING?

models. His explanation for the failure: The data are wrong:

days by 10F.... This is January [winter] weather [in early autumn]."

moment and it is a travesty that we can't. The CERES data ... sh

should be even more warming: but the data are surely wrong. Ou observing system is inadequate." [1255352257.txt]

This is the kind of bankrupt logic and blind faith we now see

Are we to believe that temperature data collected by 30-year old

Warming enterprise was based, is more reliable than that collected b

pillions of dollars worth of new land, oceanic, air and space instrume

Are we to believe that after decades of technological advancement, o

Alternatively, and more likely, the entire CO2/man-made global warn

(i.e. the "observing system") because their data does not show warmin

theory is wrong. Science has a rule: "if the theory doesn't fit

0 500 1000 1500 200

INTYRE EXPOSES BRIFFA'S YAMAL

After trying for 3 years, MCINTYRE finally obtains, b

(BRIFFA 2000)). [45] He discovers BRIFFA only used 12

ores. Furthermore, he finds that only one freak tree of the

JONES: "Haven't got a reply from the FOI person here at UEA. So I'm not entir

esterday to tell me I shouldn't be deleting emails unles this w

s - observational data, baleo dat and who made IPCC changes and

got all the latter - and there have been at least 4. We made Susan o

me fro David Holland. According to the FOI Commissioner's Offi

f UEA hold anything about IPCC, we are not obliged to pass it on, u

as anything to do with our core business - and it doesn't!" [1228922050

ed with pressure to release data, the CRU Web site claims CRU no lor

East Anglia - permitting it to snub FoIA requests to see the data.

r inspection - except to hand-picked academics - for several years. Instead, it re

cessed version, in gridded form. NASA maintains its own (GISSTEMP), but th

any errors in CRU cascade around the world, and become part of 'the science."

bal Climate Dataset, is the most cited surface temperature record by the UN $^{\circ}$

e CRU has refused to release the raw weather station data and its processing m

as the original, only its "value-added version" [29], evoking scorn.

C is a international organization, so is above any national FOI. Ev

ne numbers are correct. One way of checking would be to look or

that. I did get an email from the FOI person here early

nstruments in the 1980s, upon which the Anthropogenic Glo

temperature readings now are less reliable than those of yore?

masquerading as rational science.

TRENBERTH discusses the BBC's October 9 article, and not onl

confirms warming has stopped for 10-12 years [see {JONES 5.Jul.20 and {KELLY 26.OCT.2008}], but that this was not predicted by any

TRENBERTH: "Well I have my own article on where the heck is global

warming? We are asking that here in Boulder where we have broken recoil

the past two days for the coldest days on record.... The high the last 2 days wa

below 30F and the normal is 69F, and it smashed the previous records for th

"The fact is that we can't account for the lack of warming at th

our Rorsch] were to submit an article from a friendly colleague who wanted

intasy.... [In the 1980s, Margaret Thatcher] said to the scientists, she went to

major players in the IPCC itself. [13] loes "not call for action to prevent future climate change." [5] MARCH 7, 1979: A Miami Beach workshop on the global effects carbon dioxide from fossil fuels is conducted by the U.S. to "assess the scientific basis for projection of possible futu changes resulting from man-made release of carbon dioxid eteorological office) are contributing scientists. the biosphere in the carbon cycle" from their deliberation oup's conclusion, assuming a doubling of CO2 by 2050, is that "warming will eventually occur." [10:2] NOVEMBER, 1980: "[A conference] in Villach, Austria, in 1980

GLOBAL WARMING MAKES THE FRONT PAGE Global warming makes the front page after HANSEN provides a New York Times reporter with a preview copy of his paper "Climate Impact of Increasing Atmospheric gone far beyond what scientific evidence justified." [5]

nal political agenda and the subsequent establishment of the IPCC, concludes that ent of the three organizing bodies: "As a result of the increasing concentrations of gases, it is now believed that in the first half of the next century a rise of global mean E.] Franz points out that these conclusions were far bolder than any that had gone before, ange." [170] "[T]his time the 100 attendees participated as individuals rather es of their countries, and they were selected by the three sponsoring agencies. agencies bressured the attendees for bolicy recommendations with the LINEP representative a recommendation about moving away from fossil fuels, the WMO asking for clear ments about the state of knowledge and for advice to policy makers and the ICSU asking for policies at the national and international level. **That one sponsoring organization** already asking for a movement away from fossil fuel and another asking for 'necessary' policies shows that they had decided on the conclusion even ur scientific knowledge of increases in CO2 and other radiatively active gases, and the pocio-economic impacts, and to develop sound recommendations for action by countries

Hansen, saying he had gone far beyond what scientific evidence

ert Bolin, the first chairman of the IPCC was already heavily committed to the At the third IPCC session (Washington, February, 1990), Bert Creation of the United Nations n of manmade warming, having worked previously for the UNEP, WMO, the and, very crucially, having documented that the Villach conference reached

loughton, Director General of the UK's Met Office and chair

al chapter of the 2007 [IPCC] report, the chapter in which human

ley Centre. At one stage the IPCC even had offices in the Hadley

Met Office's offshoot the Hadley Centre for Climate

ing Group I, is "instrumental in [establishing]

HANSEN: STOP WAFFLING; OTHER SCIENTISTS REBUKE HANSEN been but in blace at least three years earlier.... James Hansen, director of the nce, Technology and Space, said, in effect, that he was 99 percent certain that anging Atmospherel organised by scientists involved with the Villach and kshops of 1987. This conference brought together 341 delegates, ng 20 politicians and ambassadors, 118 policy and legal advisers and senior ent officials, 73 physical scientists, 50 industry representatives and en

THIRD WORLD ECONOMIC COMPENSATION IS ALREADY ON THE AGENDA Bolin (Chair IPCC Working Group I) states that the fossil fuel and speaks of the financial aid and technology transfer that will

1251, and shows the Medieval Warm Period of 10 ears ago and the Little Ice Age of 300 years ago, which, as d Evans explains in his article "A Simple Proof that Global Warming Is Not Man-Made" is just that. [25] oth the MWP and LIA were global phenomena and major oblems for the CO2/man-made global warming theory, so

SANTER was responsible for a highly controversial rewriting of key passages i the 1995 IPCC report (see {WALL STREET JOURNAL 12.Jun.1996}). BEFORE: "No study to date has positively attributed all or part [of observed climat

change] to anthropogenic causes." - IPPC 1995 [126]

1976 - 2000

MPERATURES WARMING GLOBA

BEFORE: "When will an anthropogenic effect on climate be identified? It is not sur that the best answer to this question is, 'We do not know.'" -- IPCC 1995 [126] **AFTER:** "The body of ... evidence now points to a discernible human influence on global

ECOND IPCC ASSESSMENT REPORT

As with the IPCC's 1990 report, key lead authors and other contributors to the

report include senior staff from the UK Meteorological Office and CRU. [130]

• Kiminori Itoh, IPCC expert reviewer, and award-winning environmental physical chemist: "[The promotion of warming fears] is 'the worst scientific scandal in history.... When people come to know what the truth is, they will feel deceived by science and scientists.'" [55] • Kenneth Green (2009), IPCC expert reviewer: "[W]e can expect climate crisis industry to grow increasingly shrill, and increasingly hostile toward anyone who questions their authority." • Vincent Gray, IPCC expert reviewer of report drafts since 1990, and author of over 100 papers: "The claims of the IPCC are dangerous unscientific nonsense." [55] • Tom Segalstad (2009), former IPCC expert reviewer, and geologist at the University of Oslo: "Most leading geologists throughout the world know that the IPCC's view of Earth processes are implausible if not impossible." [60] • Philip Lloyd (2009), IPCC co-coordinating lead author, and author of over 150 peer reviewed publications: "It isn't necessary to list all the changes I have identified between what the scientists actually said and what the policy make e the Summary for Policy Makers said they said. The process is so flawed that the result is tantamount to fraud. As an authority, the IPCC should be consigned to the scrapheap without delay." [65] Richard Lindzen, former IPCC lead author, and current Alfred P. Sloan professor of meteorology at MIT: "Controlling carbon is kind of a bureaucrat's dream. If you control carbon, you control life." [The IPC Subject the strict of the stri • Paul Reiter, former malaria expert at the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, and current professor of entomology and tropical disease at the Pasteur Institute, who resigned from the IPCC and had to threaten lega action to have his name removed: "That is how they make it seem that all the top scientists are agreed." "For twelve years, my colleagues and I have protested against the unsubstantiated claims that climate change is causing the disease [malaria] to spread." "We have done the studies and challenged the alarmists - but they continue to ignore the facts, and perpetuate the lies." [55] • Patrick J. Michaels, IPCC expert reviewer, past president of the American Association of State Climatologists, and current professor of environmental sciences at the University of Virginia: "Nowhere in the traditionally refereed i.e., peer reviewed] scientific literature do we find any support for Gore's hypothesis. Instead, there's an un-refereed editorial by NASA climate firebrand James E. Hansen in the journal Climate Change — edited by Steven Schneider, of Stanford University, who said in 1989 that scientists had to choose 'the right balance between being effective and honest' about global warming..." [55] • John Christy, IPCC lead author, professor of atmospheric science and director of the Earth System Science Center at the University of Alabama (Huntsville): "I was at the table with three Europeans, and we were having lunch. As

they were talking about their role as [IPCC] lead authors ... [and] how they were trying to make the report so dramatic that the United States would just have to sign that Kyoto Protocol." [55]

U.S. SENATE REPORT: OVER 400 PROMINENT SCIENTISTS DISPUTE MAN-MADE GLOBAL WARMING CLAIMS (report updated to 700 scientists in 2009]) [55]

[0968691929.txt] (Also see [0962818260.txt].) What ensued was necessarily a rather speculative discussion with the following neeting as a 'strategic partnership' with the TC, broadly equivalent to interested in emissions trading and CDM." [uea-tyndall-shell-memo.doc]

REAL OBJECTIVE OF IPCC ADMITTED: GLOBALIZATION ELLY explains to Paul Horsman of Greenpeace the purpose of the IPCC (Horsman is restating KELLY in this e-mail) [greenpeace.txt]: HORSMAN: "One particular thing you said - and we agreed - was about the IPCC orts and the broader climate negotiations were working to the globalisation agenda riven by organisations like the WTO [World Trade Organization]." (Also see [141].)

CITS FUNDING FROM SHELL, BP AND ESSO

also give Shell a role in setting CRU's research agenda.

mmarizes his discussions to HULME and ORIORDAN:

ably the best route through to funding from elsewhere in the or

ing the foundation as they seem to have good access to the top le

e and Tim Notes from the meeting with Shell Internati

questioning the CO2/man-made global warming (AGW) theory

nely dismissed as being in the pay of Big Oil. However, in 2000,

nly solicits funding from Shell (after already trying BP and Esso

2.txt]), but also considers a strategic partnership which would

"The lead author for the millennial paleoclimate section was Keith Briffa ... The Team features prominently in the chapter – a search on Mann turns up 92 mentions; BRIFFA 36 mentions; JONE s. Like MANN before him, BRIFFA used his position as Lead Author to publicize his own w Vostok Ice Cores 250,000 - 200,000 years ago

THEN CO2 INCREASES "In the 1990's the classic Vostok ice co lock steb moving at the same time. made sense to worry that carbon ioxide did influence temperature. But hat **carbon lagged behind** before carbon starts to move [see graph]. The extraordinary thing is that yet virtually unknown outside these

the lag is well accepted by climatologists,

THER WAY AROUND: FIRST

MPERATURE INCREASES

VON STORCH: TIME TO TOSS THE HOCKEY

Andy Revkin of the New York Times tells OSBORN

time to dump the hockey stick and start over.

Revkin: "again, takeaway msg is that mann method

can only work if past variability same as variability

during period used to calibrate your method.

by the way, von storch doesn't concur with

doesn't take it further than that." [1096382684.txt]

that von Storch ({WIGLEY 24.Apr.2003}) says i

'thickening and expanding." [118] (Also see {TIMESONLINE 17.Jan.2010} and [121].) And, in fact, are doing so worldwide. [119] 3) In the eastern Himalayas, NASA GISS [120:1] and UNEP [120:2] report that soot from densely populated south Asian cities ilso to blame for warming: "Soot's role in Himalayan Warming ... Over areas of the Himalayas, the rate of warming is more than five times faster than warming globally.... There's a localized phenomenon at play." [120:1] [118]

"The latest government survey of bolar bears ow the population of polar bears has ount placed the number at 1,400." [83]

the 1980s and 1990s (a time when the Earth was warming). [108] [107] (Also see {UN FAO 2001}.)

"Where are the headlines? Where are the press releases? Where is all the ention? "The ice melt across during the Antarctic summer (October-January) inding reported last week by Marco Tedesco and Andrew Monaghan in the journal Geophysical Research Letters." [8/] 193,000 square miles (500,000 sq km). That's the size of 10 states!" 119] "Arctic Sea Ice Extent exceeds 2005 for this date [September 21]." [122]

documents requested under the Freedom of Information Act."" These docume with their legal obligation to produce responsive documents." [73]

Unless noted, emphasis has been added. UPDATES AND PRINTABLE FORMATS AVAILABLE FROM: http://joannenova.com.au/global-warming/climategate-30-year-timeline © 2010 Mohib Ebrahim / timelines [at] sent.com

250,000 240,000 230,000 220,000 210,000 200,000

lata of stations located in areas not listed in the ... UK (HadCRUT) survey often does ist and loose with Russian - more particularly Siberian - temperature records. [See {JONES 31.Mar.2004}]." [75] (See [82] for more.)

LACIER FACTS FROM NASA GISS, UNEP, AMS AND OTHERS Glaciers have been receding since the bottom of the Little Ice Age some 300 years ago (see {MEDIEVAL WARM PERIOD 995}). Gangotri Glacier image [116] shows its retreat since 1780. Within this 300 year trend, glaciers also advance and retreat roaming the vast Arctic expanses of northern /-30 years [117], and are now slowing their retreat: "Gangotri's drawdown - 20 metres per annum in the '70s - is now mere six ————— Quebec, Labrador and southern Baffin Island ————— Pacific between cool and warm periods. Unlike El Niño a year." "Even if Gangotri retreats at 20 m per annum, it will last for 1,500 years." [121] (Also see {UN FAO 2001}.) American Meteorological Society reports "glaciers are only shrinking in the eastern Himalayas. Further west ... glaciers are

MASA: PACIFIC NOW IN ITS LONG TERM COOL PHASE GREATEST ANTARCTICA ICE IN 30 YEARS; ARCTIC ICE RECOVERS Pacific switches to the cool phase of the Pacific Decadal Oscillation. The PDO is a long-term alternation of the and La Niña, which may occur every 3 to 7 years and hase for 20 to 30 years. The shift in the PDO can significant implications for global climate. The Pacific was in the Oscillation's warm phase during most of

— of 2008-2009 was the lowest ever recorded in the satellite history. Such was the WITH FOI REQUESTS AND RELEASE CLIMATE DOCUMENTS

CLIMATEGATE: 30 YEARS IN THE MAKING

NOTES AND REFERENCES

- Printed, the chart's full size is 94" x 34" (two A0 landscape pages). At this size, the text is 9 pt. Smaller sizes can be printed in tile
 format using Adobe Acrobat (full product, not free reader) or downloaded pre-tiled for various page sizes. Murals should be
 printed at 200% size, and will be readable from 3' away.
- On screen, you can zoom in and out, scroll vertically to see a given time period, or horizontally to see a given theme.
- CRU documents are referenced by document name, such as [1120593115.txt] or [HARRY_READ_ME.TXT]. These documents can
 be found at the following:

http://www.eastangliaemails.com http://www.climate-gate.org http://johncostella.webs.com

- References in curved brackets { } (e.g., {MCINTYRE AND MCKITRICK 2003}) are to dated event boxes.
- All spelling, punctuation, and grammatical errors in quotations of CRU e-mails are found in the originals.
- All quotations have been italicized. Unless noted, all emphasis within quotes has been added.
- Numbered references are below.
- [1] "Another Ice Age," *Time,* New York, June 24, 1974 http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,944914,00.html
- [2] Noel Sheppard, "I50 Years of Global Warming and Cooling at the New York Times," NewsBusters, Alexandria, March 26, 2007 http://newsbusters.org/node/I1640
- [3] Peter Gwynne, "The Cooling World," *Newsweek*, New York, April 28,1975 http://www.denisdutton.com/cooling_world.htm
- [4] Alex Evens, David Stern, "Climate Change: The State of the Debate," Center on International Cooperation, New York, October 2007. http://www.cic.nyu.edu/internationalsecurity/docs/LondonAccordclimatepaper.pdf
- [5] Tony Gilland, "Digging up the roots of the IPCC," *Spiked*, London, June 28, 2007 http://www.spiked-online.com/index.php/site/printable/3540/

[6]	David Burns, "Climate and CO2," <i>New York Times,</i> New York, April 17, 1981 http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/edu/eesj/casestudies/globwarm.html
[7]	Joshua Good, "NASA Climatologist: Bush Censored Me," <i>BannedMagazine.com</i> , Tampa, January 24, 2007 http://www.bannedmagazine.com/JamesHansen.0001.htm
[8]	"ClimateGate Who's Who," <i>MagicJava TV,</i> [Uploaded] November 27, 2009 http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Cu_ok37HDuE&feature=player_embedded
[9]	Marcel Leroux, "Global Warming: Myth or Reality?" Springerlink, Heidelberg, 2005, pg. 30
	I.http://www.springerlink.com/content/tx341p/ 2.http://www.springerlink.com/content/t2188m57813305g7/fulltext.pdf
[10]	"Carbon Dioxide and Climate: A Scientific Assessment," National Academy of Sciences, Washington D.C., ,1979, pg. 20
	I. http://www.atmos.ucla.edu/~brianpm/download/charney_report.pdf 2. pg. I and 3
[11]	W. Wang et al, "Greenhouse Effects Due to Man-Made Perturbations," <i>Science</i> , Washington D.C., November 12, 1976 http://pubs.giss.nasa.gov/docs/1976/1976_Wang_etal.pdf
[12]	"Climate Change to the Year 2000," National Defense University, 1976 http://www.climate4you.com/ClimateAndHistory%201950-1999.htm#1976: Forecasting climate change to the year 2000
[13]	Tim Ball, "The Scientists Involved in Deliberately Deceiving the World on Climate," Canada Free Press, November 30, 2009 http://canadafreepress.com/index.php/article/17364
[14]	October 21, 1996 Letter to the Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society, Boston, January, 1997 http://www.sepp.org/Archive/controv/ipcccont/amsltr.htm
[15]	Frederick Seitz, "A Major Deception on Global Warming," <i>Wall Street Journal,</i> New York, June 12, 1996 http://www.sepp.org/Archive/controv/ipcccont/Item05.htm
[16]	Christopher Booker, "Climate change: this is the worst scientific scandal of our generation," <i>Telegraph</i> , London, November 28, 2009 http://www.telegraph.co.uk/comment/columnists/christopherbooker/6679082/Climate-change-this-is-the-worst-scientific-scandal-of-our-generation.html
[17]	Charlie Martin, "Global WarmingGate: What Does It Mean?" <i>Pajama</i> s <i>Media,</i> November 22, 2009 http://pajamasmedia.com/blog/global-warminggate-what-does-it-mean/
[18]	History, "GISS Surface Temperature Analysis," <i>Goddard Institute for Space Studies</i> , New York, January 13, 2009 http://data.giss.nasa.gov/gistemp/
[19]	"History of the Climatic Research Unit," East Anglia, nd http://www.cru.uea.ac.uk/cru/about/history/

[20]	Lawrence Solomon, "Numbers racket," National Post, Toronto, November 6, 2009
	1. http://network.nationalpost.com/np/blogs/fullcomment/archive/2009/11/06/lawrence-solomon-numbers-racket.aspx 2. http://network.nationalpost.com/np/blogs/fpcomment/archive/2009/11/07/lawrence-solomon-numbers-racket.aspx
[21]	Lorrie Goldstein, "'Botch after botch after botch,'" <i>Toronto Sun</i> , Toronto, November 29, 2009 http://www.torontosun.com/comment/columnists/lorrie_goldstein/2009/11/29/11967916-sun.html
[22]	Marc Sheppard, "CRU's Source Code: Climategate Uncovered," <i>American Thinker</i> , El Cerrito, November 25, 2009 http://www.americanthinker.com/2009/11/crus_source_code_climategate_r.html
[23]	"Climategate: hide the decline codified," Watt's Up With That, Chico, November 25, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/11/25/climategate-hide-the-decline-codified/
[24]	Steve McIntyre, "Fortress CRU," <i>Climate Audit</i> , Toronto, June 20, 2008 http://www.climateaudit.org/?p=3193
[25]	David Evans, "A Simple Proof that Global Warming Is Not Man-Made," <i>Jo Nova,</i> Perth, November 29, 2009 http://joannenova.com.au/2009/11/a-simple-proof-that-global-warming-is-not-manmade/
[26]	Joanne Nova, "The Skeptics Handbook II," <i>Jo Nova,</i> Perth, November, 2009 http://joannenova.com.au/2009/11/skeptics-handbook-ii-global-bullies-want-your-money/
[27]	Patrick Michaels, "The Dog Ate Global Warming," <i>National Review,</i> New York, September 23, 2009 http://article.nationalreview.com/?q=ZTBiMTRIMDQxNzEyMmRhZjU3ZmYzODI5MGY4ZWI5OWM=
[28]	Andrew Orlowski, "Global Warming ate my data," <i>The Register,</i> London, August 13, 2009 http://www.theregister.co.uk/2009/08/13/cru_missing/
[29]	Steve McIntyre, "CRU Responds," <i>Climate Audit</i> , Toronto, August 11, 2009 http://www.climateaudit.org/?p=6789
[30]	"Shocker CRU's Jones: GISS is inferior," Watts Up with That, Chico, November 29, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/11/29/shocker-crus-jones-giss-is-inferior/
[31]	Ben Webster, "Met Office to re-examine 160 years of climate data," <i>Times</i> , London, December 5, 2009 http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/environment/article6945445.ece
[32]	"Hockey Stick on Ice," <i>Wall Street Journal,</i> New York, February 18, 2005 http://online.wsj.com/article_email/SB110869271828758608-IdjeoNmlah4n5yta4GHaqyIm4.html
[33]	Steven Hayward, "Scientists Behaving Badly," Weekly Standard, Washington D.C., December 14, 2009 http://www.weeklystandard.com/Content/Public/Articles/000/000/017/300ubchn.asp

[34] Robert Greiner, "Climategate: The Smoking Code," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 4, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/04/climategate-the-smoking-code/ Robert Greiner, "The Smoking Code, part 2," Watts Up With that, Chico, December 5, 2009 [35] http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/05/the-smoking-code-part-2/ Marc Sheppard, "Understanding Climategate's Hidden Decline," American Thinker, El Cerrito, December 6, 2009 [36] http://www.americanthinker.com/2009/12/understanding climategates hid.html McIntyre, McKitrick, "Corrections to the Mann et al. (1998)...," Energy & Environment, Brentwood, November 2003 [37] [38] "If the CRU leak was an inside whistleblower, here's the line-up of potential suspects heroes," Climate Change Fraud, November 23, 2009 http://www.climatechangefraud.com/editorials/5657-if-the-cru-leak-was-an-inside-whistleblower-heres-the-line-up-of-potential-suspects-heroes Vincent Gray, "There Was Proof of Fraud All Along," Pajamas Media, El Segundo, November 27, 2009 [39] http://pajamasmedia.com/blog/vincent-gray-on-climategate-there-was-proof-of-fraud-all-along-pim-exclusive/ Wegman, Scott, Said, "Ad Hoc Committee Report On The 'Hockey Stick' Global Climate Reconstruction," July 14, 2006 [40] http://www.uoguelph.ca/~rmckitri/research/WegmanReport.pdf Wikipedia entry for Edward Wegman [41] http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edward_Wegman Paul Hudson, "What happened to global warming?" BBC News, London, October 9, 2009 [42] http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8299079.stm [43] M. Mann, R. Bradley, M. Hughes, "Global-scale temperature patterns and climate forcing over the past six centuries," Nature, London, April, 1988 http://www.geo.umass.edu/faculty/bradley/mann1998.pdf [44] M. Mann, R. Bradley, M. Hughes, "Northern Hemisphere Temperatures...," Geophysical Research Letters, Washington D.C., March 15, 1999 http://www.geo.umass.edu/faculty/bradley/mann I 999.pdf [45] Christopher Booker, "Climategate reveals 'the most influential tree in the world," Telegraph, London, December 5, 2009 http://www.telegraph.co.uk/comment/columnists/christopherbooker/6738111/Climategate-reveals-the-most-influential-tree-in-the-world.html Jones, Groisman, Coughlan, Plummer, Wang, Karl, "Assessment of urbanization effects...," Nature, London, September 13, 1990 [46] http://www.informath.org/apprise/a5620/b90.pdf W. Wang, Z. Zeng, T. Karl, "Urban Heat Islands in China," Geophysical Research Letters, Washington D.C., December, 1990 [47] http://www.informath.org/apprise/a5620/b23.pdf Aubrey Blumsohn, "Climate Science Fraud at Albany University?" Watts Up With That, Chico, May 2, 2009 [48] http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/05/03/climate-science-fraud-at-albany-university/

[49]	Douglas Keenan, "The fraud allegation against some climatic research of Wei-Chyung Wang," <i>Energy & Environment</i> , Brentwood, December, 2007 http://www.informath.org/pubs/EnE07a.pdf
[50]	Willis Eschenbach, "The Smoking Gun At Darwin Zero," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 8, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/08/the-smoking-gun-at-darwin-zero/
[51]	"PROFILE: James Hansen," <i>Times Online,</i> London, December 6, 2009 http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/environment/copenhagen/article6945890.ece
[52]	"Report Raises New Questions About Climate Change Assessments," U.S. House Committee On Energy And Commerce, Washington D.C., http://republicans.energycommerce.house.gov/108/home/07142006_Wegman_fact_sheet.pdf
[53]	"Caspar and the Jesus paper," Bishop Hill, New York, August 11, 2008 http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2008/8/11/caspar-and-the-jesus-paper.html
[54]	Steve McIntyre, "IPCC and the 'Trick,'" <i>Climate Audit,</i> Toronto, December 10, 2009; updates: December 11, 2009 http://climateaudit.org/2009/12/10/ipcc-and-the-trick/
[55]	"Over 400 Prominent Scientists," U.S. Senate Committee on Environment & Public Works, Washington D.C., December 20, 2007 http://epw.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?FuseAction=Minority.SenateReport
[56]	Steve McIntyre, "IPCC AR4," <i>Climate Audit</i> , Toronto, April 29, 2007 http://climateaudit.org/2007/04/29/ipcc-ar4/
[57]	Steve McIntyre, "FAQ 2005," <i>Climate Audit,</i> Toronto, 2005 http://climateaudit.org/faq/
[58]	"Statement of Dr. David Deming," U.S. Senate Committee on Environment & Public Works," Washington D.C., June 12, 2006 http://epw.senate.gov/hearing_statements.cfm?id=266543
[59]	David Deming, "Global Warming, the Politicization of Science, and Michael Crichton's State of Fear," Journal of Scientific Exploration, June 2005 http://www.sepp.org/Archive/NewSEPP/StateFear-Deming.htm
[60]	David Rose, "Special Investigation: Climate change emails row deepens," Mail Online, London, December 13, 2009 http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1235395/SPECIAL-INVESTIGATION-Climate-change-emails-row-deepensRussians-admit-DID-send-them.html
[61]	"Picking out the UHI in climatic temperature records – so easy a 6th grader can do it!" Watts Up With That, Chico, December 9, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/09/picking-out-the-uhi-in-global-temperature-records-so-easy-a-6th-grader-can-do-it/
[62]	Jeff Id, "GHCN Antarctic, 8X Actual Trend – Uses Single Warmest Station," <i>The Air Vent,</i> December 13, 2009 http://noconsensus.wordpress.com/2009/12/13/ghcn-antarctic-warming-eight-times-actual/
[63]	Rudolf Kipp, "The Medieval Warm Period – a global phenomenon ordata manipulation?" Watts Up With That, Chico, November 29, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/11/29/the-medieval-warm-period-a-global-phenonmena-unprecedented-warming-or-unprecedented-data-manipulation/

- [64] "The Medieval Warm Period A global Phenomenon," *Science Skeptical Blog*, 2009 http://pages.science-skeptical.de/MWP/MedievalWarmPeriod.html
- [65] Philip Lloyd, "End 'authority' on climate change," *Business Day,* South Africa, November 23, 2009 http://www.businessday.co.za/articles/Content.aspx?id=87726
- [66] K. Emanuel, J. Layzer, S. Ansolabehere, R. Prinn, R. Lindzen, "Great Climategate Debate," *Mit World,* Cambridge, December 10, 2009 (time index: 17:25) http://mitworld.mit.edu/video/730
- [67] K. Emanuel, J. Layzer, S. Ansolabehere, R. Prinn, R. Lindzen "Great Climategate Debate," *Mit World*, Cambridge, December 10, 2009 (time index: 26:03) http://mitworld.mit.edu/video/730
- [68] No item.
- [69] "anything short of the absolute pursuit of science cannot be accepted or tolerated," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 15, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/15/anything-short-of-the-absolute-pursuit-of-science-cannot-be-accepted-or-tolerated/
- [70] Kelvin Kemm, "Scientific evidence of global warming blows hot and cold," *Business Report*, Cape Town, December 8, 2009 http://www.br.co.za/index.php?fSectionId=561&fArticleId=5277396
- [71] Joanne. Nova, Anthony Watt, "News on the new Non Scientist Updated: now with bullying," Jo Nova, December 15, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/15/news-on-the-new-non-scientist/
- [72] I. "A Warming Bias in the U.S. Temperature Record???" (Review), CO2 Science, Tempe, December 16, 2009 http://www.co2science.org/articles/V12/N50/C1.php
 - 2. "Three Decades of Near-Surface and Lower-Troposphere Temperature Measurements," (Review), CO2 Science, Tempe, December 9, 2009 http://www.co2science.org/articles/V12/N49/C1.php
- [73] Chris Horner, "'Climate Gate' Development: CEI Files Notice of Intent to Sue NASA," American Spectator, Arlington, November 24, 2009 http://spectator.org/blog/2009/11/24/climate-gate-development-cei-f
- [74] Jeff Id, "Russian IEA claims CRU tampered with climate data cherrypicked warmest stations," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 16, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/16/russian-iea-claims-cru-tampered-with-climate-data-cherrypicked-warmest-stations/
- [75] James Delingpole, "Climategate goes SERIAL: now the Russians confirm...," *Telegraph.co.uk*, London, December 16, 2009 http://blogs.telegraph.co.uk/news/jamesdelingpole/100020126/
- [76] "Lord Monckton reports on Pachauri's eye opening Copenhagen presentation," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 17, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/17/lord-monckton-reports-on-pachauris-eye-opening-copenhagen-presentation/
- [77] "World-wide Data Manipulation Scandal Emerging," (all articles on page), *Ice Cap*, Hudson, December 12, 2009 http://icecap.us/index.php/go/joes-blog/are_we_feeling_warmer_yet/

[78]	Dexter Wright, "Climategate's Stubborn Facts," <i>American Thinker</i> , El Cerrito, December 16, 2009 http://www.americanthinker.com/2009/12/climategates_stubborn_facts.html
[79]	Patrick Michaels, "How to Manufacture a Climate Consensus," Wall Street Journal, New York, December 17, 2009 http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704398304574598230426037244.html?mod=googlenews_wsj
[80]	Lawrence Solomon, "They call this a consensus?" <i>National Post</i> , Toronto, June 2, 2007 http://www.financialpost.com/story.html?id=c47c1209-233b-412c-b6d1-5c755457a8af#ixzz0a0MsVhlW
[81]	Steve McIntyre, "Climategatekeeping #2," Climate Audit, Toronto, December 17, 2009 http://climateaudit.org/2009/12/17/climategatekeeping-2/
[82]	Barry Napier, "Russians Are Right! Met Office Uses Selective Data," <i>Canada Free Press,</i> December 17, 2009 http://canadafreepress.com/index.php/article/18055
[83]	Don Martin, "Polar bear numbers up, but rescue continues," <i>National Post</i> , Toronto, March 6, 2007 http://www.nationalpost.com/news/story.html?id=Iea8233f-I4da-4a44-b839-b7Ia9e5df868
[84]	Paul Chesser, "William Schlesinger on IPCC," Watts Up With That, Chico, February 17, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/02/17/william-schlesinger-on-ipcc-something-on-the-order-of-20-percent-have-had-some-dealing-with-climate/
[85]	"More evidence of gatekeeping," <i>Bishop Hill,</i> New York, December 17, 2009 http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2009/12/17/more-evidence-of-gatekeeping.html
[86]	Terese Brasen, "On the Vikings and Greenland," <i>Watts Up With That,</i> Chico, October 26, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/10/26/on-the-vikings-and-greenland/
[87]	"Antarctica's ice story has been put on ice," Watts Up With That, Chico, October 8, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/10/08/antarcticas-ice-story-has-been-put-on-ice/
[88]	I. "Stephen Schneider" (bio-sketch), <i>EconomicExpert.com</i> , Montreal, 2004 http://www.economicexpert.com/a/Stephen: Schneider.html
	2. Stephen Schneider editorial reprinted from the <i>Detroit News</i> , November 22, 1989 http://stephenschneider.stanford.edu/Publications/PDF_Papers/DetroitNews.pdf
[89]	1. Thomas Derr, "The Politics of Global Warming," <i>First Things</i> , New York, August/September, 2007 http://www.firstthings.com/article/2007/08/001-the-politics-of-global-warming-16
	2. Piers Akerman, "Stern's report scare-mongering," <i>Daily Telegraph,</i> Sydney, November 5, 2006 http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/news/opinion/sterns-report-scare-mongering/story-e6frezz0-1111112469535
[90]	L. Spencer, J. Bollwerk, R. Morais, "The not so peaceful world of Greenpeace,"reprinted from <i>Forbes Magazine</i> , New York, November 11, 1991 http://www.highnorth.no/Library/Movements/Greenpeace/ge-ar-gr.htm

[91]	Jeff Wells, "Some people call me Maurice," <i>Rigorous Institution</i> , Mountain View, April 21, 2005 http://rigorousintuition.blogspot.com/2005/04/some-people-call-me-maurice.html
[92]	I. Syun-Ichi Akasofu, "Climate Corrections, " <i>Wall Street Journal</i> , New York, September 21, 2007 http://uncw.edu/preeng/files/fun/global%20warming/Climate%20Corrections.pdf
	2. Syun-Ichi Akasofu (bio-sketch), Fairbanks, October 2, 2007 http://people.iarc.uaf.edu/~sakasofu/index.php
[93]	I. Christopher Monckton, "An open letter from The Viscount Monckton of Brenchley" <i>American Thinker,</i> El Cerrito, October 18, 2008 http://www.americanthinker.com/2008/10/an_open_letter_from_the_viscou_I.html
	2. Christopher Monckton, "Scare Watch: 'Global warming' will kill 6 billion," Science & Public Policy Institute, Haymarket, March 16, 2009 http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/scarewatch/6_billion.html
[94]	Christopher Monckton, "SPPI Monthly CO2 Report: May," Science & Public Policy Institute, Haymarket, June 9, 2009 http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/monthly_report/monthly_co2_report_may.html
[95]	"MIT researcher finds evidence of global warming on Neptune's largest moon," MIT News, Cambridge, June 24, 1998 http://web.mit.edu/newsoffice/1998/triton.html
[96]	Lawrence Solomon, "Look to Mars for the truth on global warming," <i>Canada.com</i> (reprinted from <i>National Post</i>), Toronto, January 26, 2007 http://www.canada.com/nationalpost/story.html?id=edae9952-3c3e-47ba-913f-7359a5c7f723
[97]	"Neptune News," World Climate Report, May 8, 2007 http://www.worldclimatereport.com/index.php/2007/05/08/neptune-news/
[98]	Richard Lindzen, "Climate of Fear: Global-warming alarmists intimidate dissenting scientists," Wall Street Journal, New York, April 21, 2006 http://www.opinionjournal.com/extra/?id=110008220
[99]	Timothy Carter (bio-sketch), Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research, Potsdam, February 19, 2009 http://www.pik-potsdam.de/infodesk/education/alter-net/2008/04-09.2008/carter/carter_cv
[100]	Richard Somerville (bio-sketch), <i>Richard Somerville.com</i> , Carlsbad, 2007-2010 http://richardsomerville.com/
[101]	Eystein Jansen (bio-sketch), International Geological Congress, International Union of Geological Sciences, Washington D.C., 2008 http://33igc.org/coco/entrypage.aspx?t=climate%2Bchange&containerid=11714&parentid=11078&entrypage=true&guid=1&Inodeid=7&pageid=5002&ObjectID=11948
[102]	Founders (bio-sketches), Real Climate, Washington D.C., December 6, 2004 http://www.realclimate.org/index.php/archives/category/extras/contributor-bios/
[103]	Eric Steig(bio-sketch), University of Washington, Seattle, May 26, 2006 http://earthweb.ess.washington.edu/~steig/

[104]	Eugene Wahl (bio-sketch),National Environmental, Satellite, Data, and Information Service, November 4, 2008 http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/cv/cv2-wahl.html
[105]	Stefan Rahmstorf (bio-sketch), Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research, Potsdam, nd http://www.pik-potsdam.de/~stefan/
[106]	"Top New Zealand climate scientist sacked for talking to media," <i>Climate Realists,</i> Ashford, April 25, 2009 http://climaterealists.com/index.php?id=3315
[107]	"La Nina and Pacific Decadal Oscillation Cool the Pacific," <i>Earth Observatory,</i> Greenbelt, April 29, 2008 http://earthobservatory.nasa.gov/IOTD/view.php?id=8703
[108]	"Oscillation Rules as the Pacific Cools," [NASA] Jet Propulsion Laboratory News, December 9, 2008 http://www.jpl.nasa.gov/news/news.cfm?release=2008-23 l
[109]	Lawrence Solomon, "Wikipedia's climate doctor," <i>Financial Post</i> , Toronto, December 19, 2009 http://www.financialpost.com/opinion/story.html?id=2361926
[110]	Steve McIntyre, "Climategatekeeping: Wikipedia," <i>Climate Audit</i> , Toronto, December 19, 2009 http://climateaudit.org/2009/12/19/climategatekeeping-wikipedia/
[111]	Lawrence Solomon, "The Opinionator," <i>National Post,</i> Toronto, March 3, 2008 http://network.nationalpost.com/np/blogs/fpcomment/archive/2008/05/03/who-is-william-connolley-solomon.aspx
[112]	"More on Wikipedia and Connolley – he's been canned as a Wiki administrator," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 19, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/19/more-on-wikipedia-and-connolley-hes-been-canned-as-a-wiki-administrator/
[113]	Lawrence Solomon, "Statistics needed," <i>National Post</i> , Toronto, November 28, 2006 http://www.nationalpost.com/story.html?id=22003a0d-37cc-4399-8bcc-39cd20bed2f6&k=0
[114]	Willis Eschenbach, "Darwin Zero Before and After," Watts Up With That, Chico, December 20, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/12/20/darwin-zero-before-and-after/
[115]	Tim Mitchell (bio-sketch), Tyndall Centre for Climate Change, East Anglia, nd http://web.archive.org/web/20040217140147/http://www.cru.uea.ac.uk/~timm/personal/index.html
[116]	Gangotri glacier image showing retreats to 2001, National Snow and Ice Data Center, Boulder, nd http://nsidc.org/glims/glaciermelt/images/gangotri4.jpg
[117]	Don Easterbrook (bio-sketch), Western Washington University, Bellingham, December 12, 2009 http://www.ac.wwu.edu/~dbunny/research/global/215.pdf
[118]	Christopher Booker, "Stubborn glaciers fail to retreat, awkward polar bears continue to multiply," <i>Telegraph</i> , London, November 23, 2008 http://www.telegraph.co.uk/comment/columnists/christopherbooker/3563714/Stubborn-glaciers-fail-to-retreat-awkward-polar-bears-continue-to-multiply.html

- [119] "Glaciers are growing around the world, including the United States," *Ice Age Now, October 20, 2009* http://www.iceagenow.com/Growing Glaciers.htm
- [120] I. "New Study Turns Up the Heat on Soot's Role in Himalayan Warming," NASA News and Features, Washington D.C., December 14, 2009 http://www.nasa.gov/topics/earth/features/himalayan-warming.html
 - 2. "Wide Spread and Complex Climatic Changes Outlined...,"" United Nations Environment Programme, Nairobi, November 13, 2008 http://www.unep.org/Documents.Multilingual/Default.asp?DocumentID=550&ArticleID=5978&I=en
- [121] Ashish Tripathi, "Gangotri: From here to eternity," *Times of India,* March 24, Delhi, 2008 http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/No threat to Gangotri/articleshow/2892632.cms
- [122] "2009 Arctic Sea Ice Extent exceeds 2005 for this date," Watts Up With That, Chico, September 21, 2009 http://wattsupwiththat.com/2009/09/21/2009-arctic-sea-ice-extent-exceeds-2005-for-this-date/
- [123] Roger Highfield, "World's oldest tree discovered in Sweden," *Telegraph*, London, April 17, 2008 http://www.telegraph.co.uk/science/science-news/3339982/Worlds-oldest-tree-discovered-in-Sweden.html
- [124] Terence Corcoran, "A 2,000-page epic of science and skepticism," *National Post*, Toronto, Part 1: December 18, 2009; Part 2: December 21, 2009 http://network.nationalpost.com/np/blogs/fpcomment/archive/2009/12/18/terence-corcoran-a-2-000-page-epic-of-science-and-skepticism-part-1.aspx http://network.nationalpost.com/np/blogs/fpcomment/archive/2009/12/21/terence-corcoran-a-2-000-page-epic-of-science-and-skepticism-part-2.aspx
- [125] Steve McIntyre, "Where did IPCC 1990 Figure 7c Come From?" Climate Audit, Toronto, May 9, 2009 http://climateaudit.org/2008/05/09/where-did-ipcc-1990-figure-7c-come-from-httpwwwclimateauditorgp3072previewtrue/
- [126] Christopher Monckton's Speech before the Minnesota Free Market Institute, St. Paul, October 15, 2009 (see second URL for pdf. presentation) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=stij8sUybx0 http://www.friendsofscience.org/assets/documents/monckton_2009.pdf
- [127] Marc Sheppard, "UN Climate Reports: They Lie," American Thinker, El Cerrito, October 5, 2009 http://www.americanthinker.com/2009/10/un_climate_reports_they_lie.html
- [128] Alan Caruba, "Climategate: A Willful Ignorance," CNSNews.com, Alexandria, December 7, 2009 http://www.cnsnews.com/commentary/article/58137
- [129] Mike Shumlich, "The real 'Climategate' creates climate smokescreen," *The Martlet*, Victoria, December 2, 2009 http://www.martlet.ca/article/20606-the-real-climategate-creates-climate
- [130] John McLean, "Climate Science Corrupted," Science & Public Policy Institute, Haymarket, November 20, 2009 http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/images/stories/papers/originals/climate_science_corrupted.pdf

I. Joanne Nova, "Climate Money," Jo Nova, Perth, July 21, 2009 [131] http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/images/stories/papers/originals/climate money.pdf 2. "Our Changing Planet: A US Strategy for Global Change Research," U.S. Global Change Research Program, Washington D.C., 1989 http://www.usgcrp.gov/usgcrp/Library/OCPstrategy1989.pdf http://www.usgcrp.gov/usgcrp/Library/default.htm [132] Anthony Watt, "Is the U.S. Surface Temperature Record Reliable?" The Heartland Institute, Chicago, 2009 (See second URL for related article.) http://wattsupwiththat.files.wordpress.com/2009/05/surfacestationsreport spring09.pdf http://wattsupwiththat.com/test/ "Earth is Cooling...No It's Warming," Earth Observatory, Greenbelt, December 24, 2009 [133] http://earthobservatory.nasa.gov/Features/GISSTemperature/giss_temperature2.php "Carbon Emissions Trading Markets Worldwide," Bharat Book Bureau, Mumbai, May, 2009 [134] http://www.bharatbook.com/Market-Research-Reports/Carbon-Emissions-Trading-Markets-Worldwide.html [135] "Climate Change Alarmism Timeline 1895-2009," An Honest Climate Debate, August 2, 2009 http://anhonestclimatedebate.wordpress.com/2009/08/02/climate-change-alarmism-timelin/ **[136]** Martin Durkin. Dir., The Great Global Warming Swindle (video), WAG TV, London, March 9, 2007, time index: 7:19, (9:27 in UR-linked segment) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BeY8oqAGhyA&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=0&playnext=I [137] Ibid, time index: 8:52 (1:01 in UR-linked segment) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QKWA9V5UQMk&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=I [138] Ibid, time index: 9:16 (1:25 in UR-linked segment) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BeY8ogAGhyA&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=0&playnext=I [139] Ibid, time index: 35:31 (7:45 in UR-linked segment) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=latZM6zi5IU&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=3 [140] Ibid, time index: 35:45 (8:00 in UR-linked segment) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=latZM6zi5IU&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=3 Ibid, time index: 40:47 (3:00 in UR-linked segment) [141] http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dBIGTISqhIU&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=4 Ibid, time index: 43:00 (5:15 in UR-linked segment) [142] http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dBIGTISqhIU&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=4 Ibid, time index: 1:05:55(8:15 in UR-linked segment and continued in second UR-linked segment) [143] http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q4llk0qv9Ew&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=6 http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ehOIYKXWOhU&feature=PlayList&p=EA20B42EAE54782A&index=7

- [144] Marlo Lewis, *Policy Peril: Straight Talk About Global Warming* (video), Competitive Enterprise Institute, Washington D.C., July 17, 2009, time index 23:58 http://ceiondemand.org/2009/07/17/policy-peril-global-warming/
- [145] Michael Crichton, "Aliens cause global warming" (speech), California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, January 17, 2003 http://www.michaelcrichton.net/speech-alienscauseglobalwarming.html
- [146] I. Leonid Klyashtorin, "Climate Change and Long-Term Fluctuations..." (abstract), Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN, Rome, 2001 http://www.fao.org/documents/pub_dett.asp?pub_id=61004&lang=en
 - 2. "Chapter 2: Dynamics Of Climatic And Geophysical Indices" http://www.fao.org/docrep/005/Y2787E/y2787e03.htm#bm03
- [147] David Douglas and John Christy, "A Climatology Conspiracy?" American Thinker, El Cerrito, December 27, 2009 http://www.americanthinker.com/2009/12/a climatology conspiracy.html
- [148] Joanne Nova, "The 800 year lag graphed," Jo Nova, Perth, August 30, 2008 http://joannenova.com.au/global-warming/ice-core-graph/
- [149] Climategate Documentary, Yleisradio TVI, Helsinki,December 7, 2009, time index 1:39 http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YVDHbOu7Sq8&NR=I
- P.J. O'Rourke, All the Trouble in the World, Boston, 1994, pg. 167

 http://books.google.com/books?id=Ouyr7shT8tsC&pg=PA167&lpg=PA167&dq=%22he+threat+of+a+new+ice+age+must+now+stand+alongside+nuclear+war%22+

 Nigel+calder&source=bl&ots=JEXyyYE5vs&sig=beQ07lpLnzXOqDg2E_vW62gGTXk&hl=en&ei=YH8-S6bhKY6mswPXl9HJBA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&res

 num=1&ved=0CAcQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=%22he%20threat%20of%20a%20new%20ice%20age%20must%20now%20stand%20alongside%20nuclear%20war%22%2

 0Nigel%20calder&f=false
- [151] Richard Lindzen, "Global Warming: The Origin and Nature of the Alleged Scientific Consensus," Cato Institute, Washington D.C., Spring 1992 http://www.cato.org/pubs/regulation/regv15n2/reg15n2g.html
- [152] "Right for 27 years: 1981 Hansen study finds warming trend that could raise sea levels," Climate Progress, Washington DC., August 27, 2008 http://climateprogress.org/2008/08/27/right-for-27-years-1981-hansen-study-finds-warming-trend-that-could-raise-sea-levels/
- [153] Joanne Nova, "CRU Data-Cooking: Recipe Exposed!" Jo Nova, November 30, 2009 http://joannenova.com.au/2009/11/cru-data-cooking-recipe-exposed/
- [154] I. "Global Warming Petition Project FAQ," *Petitionproject.org*, Cave Junction, nd http://www.petitionproject.org/frequently_asked_questions.php
 - 2. "Qualifications of Signers," *Petitionproject.org*, Cave Junction, nd http://www.petitionproject.org/qualifications_of_signers.php
- [155] Steve McIntyre, "Difference in Yamal Versions 'Not Insignificant," Climate Audit, Toronto, January 4, 2010 http://climateaudit.org/2010/01/04/difference-in-yamal-versions-not-insignificant/

- [156] Keith Briffa, "Annual climate variability in the Holocene: interpreting the message of ancient trees," *Quaternary Science Reviews*, Oxford, January 1, 2000 http://post.queensu.ca/~biol527/Briffa%20and%20Keith%202000.pdf

 http://www.sciencedirect.com/science? ob=ArticleURL& udi=B6VBC-40378TB-8& user=10& rdoc=1& fmt=& orig=search& sort=d& docanchor=&view=c& acc
- [157] Steve McIntyre, "The Euro Hockey Team and Yamal," Climate Audit, Toronto, October 27, 2006 http://climateaudit.org/2006/10/27/the-euro-hockey-team-and-yamal/
- [158] Steve McIntyre, "Fresh Data on Briffa's Yamal #1," Climate Audit, September 26, 2009 http://climateaudit.org/2009/09/26/briffas-yamal-crack-cocaine-for-paleoclimatologists/
- [159] Olive Crook, "More on Climategate," Clive Crook, *The Atlantic*, Washington D.C., November 30, 2009 http://clivecrook.theatlantic.com/archives/2009/11/more on climategate.php
- [160] Kenneth Green, "A Death Spiral for Climate Alarmism, Redux?" Master Resource, Houston, September 30, 2009 http://masterresource.org/?p=5036

t=C000050221& version=1& urlVersion=0& userid=10&md5=1c920ab5c89ecd8ebf8f4bd564eddcde

- "More Than 700 International Scientists Dissent..." U.S. Senate Committee on Environment & Public Works, Washington D.C., December 11, 2008 http://epw.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?FuseAction=Minority.Blogs&ContentRecord_id=2674E64F-802A-23AD-490B-BD9FAF4DCDB7
- Patrick Michaels, "Sound and Fury: The Science and Politics of Global Warming," Cato Institute, Washington D.C., 1992, pg. 81-83 http://books.google.com/books?id=of7lmKM9XxwC&pg=PA26&lpg=PA26&dq=%22Sound+and+Fury%22+folland&source=bl&ots=jwrKektd4e&sig=C2iGmyspzxf2O ZI0Bjfqm3BkvxE&hl=en&ei=wLFHS4Nag56yA9qfifYP&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CAYQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=&f=false
- [163] "Quotes on Global Warming Theory," Association of British Drivers, Kenley, nd http://www.abd.org.uk/resources/quotes/gwt.htm
- [164] Steve McIntyre, "Short Bio: Steven McIntyre," Toronto, nd http://www.uoguelph.ca/~rmckitri/research/stevebio.doc
- [165] Ross McKitrick (curriculum vitae) , University of Guelph, Guelph, nd http://www.uoguelph.ca/~rmckitri/cv.html
- [166] Stephen Schneider (bio-sketch), Stanford University, Stanford, nd http://stephenschneider.stanford.edu/Biography/BioFrameset.html?http://stephenschneider.stanford.edu/Biography/Biography.html
- [167] Patrick Courrielche, "Peer-to-Peer Review: How 'Climategate' Marks the Maturing of..." Big Journalism, Los Angeles, January, 2010
 - 1. http://bigiournalism.com/pcourrielche/2010/01/08/peer-to-peer-review-how-climategate-marks-the-maturing-of-a-new-science-movement-part-i/
 - 2. http://bigiournalism.com/pcourrielche/2010/01/10/peer-to-peer-review-part-ii-how-climategate-marks-the-maturing-of-a-new-science-movement/
 - 3. http://bigjournalism.com/pcourrielche/2010/01/12/peer-to-peer-review-part-iii-how-climategate-marks-the-maturing-of-a-new-science-movement/

- [168] "Primary United States Climate Centers Now Caught In Data Manipulation," KUSI News, San Diego, January 14, 2010
 - 1. http://www.kusi.com/weather/colemanscorner/81532492.html
 - 2. http://www.kusi.com/weather/colemanscorner/81559212.html
 - 3. http://wattsupwiththat.com/2010/01/14/john-colemans-hourlong-news-special-global-warming-the-other-side-now-online-all-five-parts-here/
- [169] "Dexter Wright, "Climategate: How to Hide the Sun," American Thinker, El Cerrito, January 14, 2010 http://www.americanthinker.com/2010/01/climategate_how_to_hide_the_su.html
- [170] Wendy Franz, "The Development of an International Agenda for Climate Change," IIASA Interim Report, Laxenberg, September, 1997 http://www.iiasa.ac.at/Admin/PUB/Documents/IR-97-034.pdf
- [171] Joseph D'Aleo, "Climategate: Leaked Emails Inspired Data Analyses..." (preliminary introduction), Science & Public Policy Institute, Haymarket, 2010 http://icecap.us/images/uploads/NOAAroleinclimategate.pdf
- [172] I. "GHCN Database Adjustments," Save Capitalism, December 2, 2009 http://savecapitalism.wordpress.com/2009/12/02/ghcn-database-adjustments/
 - 2. "GHCN and Adjustment Trends," Save Capitalism, December 12, 2009 http://statpad.wordpress.com/2009/12/12/ghcn-and-adjustment-trends/
 - 3. Jeff Id, "CRU #2 Why we look at data and code," *The Air Vent,* December 30, 2009 http://noconsensus.wordpress.com/2009/12/30/cru-2-why-we-look-at-data-and-code/
 - 4. E.M. Smith, "GHCN -- GIStemp Interactions -- The Bolivia Effect," *Musings from the Chiefio*, January 8, 2010 http://chiefio.wordpress.com/2010/01/08/ghcn-gistemp-interactions-the-bolivia-effect/g
- [173] I. Joseph D'Aleo,"2008 Coldest Year Since 2000 and Clearly Not a Top Ten Warmest Year," *Icecap,* Hudson, January 11, 2009 (source graph re-colored)
 http://icecap.us/index.php/go/joes-blog/2008_coldest_year_since_2000_and_clearly_not_a_top_ten_warmest_year/
 - 2. Ross McKitrick, "The Graph of Temperature vs. Number of Stations", University of Guelph, Guelph, nd http://www.uoguelph.ca/~rmckitri/research/nvst.html
- [174] I. Jonathan Leake, Chris Hastings, "World misled over Himalayan glacier meltdown," Sunday Times, London, January 17, 2010 http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/environment/article6991177.ece
 - 2. "Sifting climate facts from speculation," New Scientist, London, January 13, 2010 http://www.newscientist.com/article/mg20527432.800-sifting-climate-facts-from-speculation.html